

R. FRITH

CAI Z 1  
-63B500

FINAL REPORT  
(VOLUME I)

AUTHOR: W. G. McConkey

TITLE: The orientation of the educational system so far as primary and secondary schools for Whites are concerned, to the bilingual and bicultural structure of white South African society.

DIV: VIII-B

Report No. 12





*Presented to the*  
LIBRARY *of the*  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

*by*  
Mr. Royce Frith  
Commissioner

Royal Commission on  
Bilingualism and  
Biculturalism

**ACCOPRESS**

GENUINE PRESSBOARD BINDER

CAT. NO. **BP 2507 EMB**

**ACCO CANADIAN COMPANY LTD.**  
**TORONTO**

OSDENSBURG, N.Y., CHICAGO, LONDON

CA1 Z 1  
-63B500

THE ORIENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM,  
SO FAR AS PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SCHOOLS FOR  
WHITES ARE CONCERNED, TO THE BILINGUAL AND  
BICULTURAL STRUCTURE OF WHITE SOUTH AFRICAN  
SOCIETY.

Report Presented to the Royal Commission on  
Bilingualism and Biculturalism

VOLUME I

W.B. Schabas

February, 1966.





THE ORIENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM,  
SO FAR AS PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SCHOOLS FOR  
WHITES ARE CONCERNED, TO THE BILINGUAL AND  
BICULTURAL STRUCTURE OF WHITE SOUTH AFRICAN  
SOCIETY.

Report Presented to the Royal Commission on  
Bilingualism and Biculturalism

W.G. McConkey

February, 1966.

THE ORIENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM,  
SO FAR AS PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SCHOOLS FOR  
WHITES ARE CONCERNED, TO THE BILTINGAL AND  
BICULTURAL STRUCTURE OF WHITE SOUTH AFRICAN  
SOCIETY.



Report Presented to the Royal Commission on  
Bilingualism and Biculturalism

Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2024 with funding from  
University of Toronto

W.G. McConkey  
February, 1968



# C O N T E N T S

(Vol. 1)

	<u>Page</u>
Notes on terms used . . . . .	i
Tables included in text . . . . .	iv
Tables supplementary to text . . . . .	v
Brief Resumé of Report . . . . .	viii
INTRODUCTORY - South Africa a multiracial, multi-cultural and multilingual country	1
Section I - Dutch and English in the Cape Colony from 1652 to 1910 . . . . .	10
Section II - Dutch and English in the Schools of the Transvaal, Orange Free State and Natal until 1910 . . . . .	27
Section III - The South Africa Act. The Official Languages. The Provincial Councils and Education. Legislation about the two official languages in Schools. Compulsory mother-tongue instruction <u>versus</u> parental option	44
Section IV - The Transition from Dutch to Afrikaans in the Schools. Definitive recognition of Afrikaans (1925)	56
Section V - English and Afrikaans in the schools 1925-1939. Urbanisation. Single-medium, dual-medium and parallel-medium schools . . . . .	68
Section VI - The Bilingualism Survey of 1938	89
Section VII - Experiments in Bilingual Education	109

(Vol. II)

Section VIII - Christian-National Education . . . . .	136
Section IX - Medium of instruction. Extension of home-language principle to secondary school. Present provision. Parental option in Natal. Statistics.	147





## Contents

	<u>Page</u>
Section X - Instruction in the Second Language	164
Section XI - The Teaching Establishment. Reasons for Afrikaner Preponderance. Some effects of this . . . . .	171
Section XII - Training of teachers. Separate and parallel institutions. Staffing. Inducements to students to become bilingual. Encouragement of understanding and appreciation of other culture . . . . .	182
Section XIII - Appointments and Promotions of Teachers. Incentives to improve proficiency in the second language. Schools Boards and Committees. Preference on Religious or Cultural Grounds . . . . .	193
Section XIV - Biculturalism and teachers' organisations. Outlook and cultural objectives. Extent of co-operation. Some cultural organisations. The National Advisory Education Council	205
Section XV - Biculturalism and the curriculum. Language Studies (official and other languages). History and Social Studies. Textbooks. School and public libraries. Schools radio services . . . . .	218
Section XVI - Biculturalism and the non-White schools . . . . .	231
CONCLUSION . . . . .	257
APPENDIX . . . . .	274





### Notes on Terms Used

Medium of instruction: The language in which instruction is given.

English-medium school: A school in which all school business is done and all instruction is given in English; provided that other languages, e.g. Afrikaans, Latin, French, German, may be taught by the direct method.

Afrikaans-medium school: A school in which all school business is done and all instruction is given in Afrikaans; provided that other languages, e.g. English, Latin, French, German, may be taught by the direct method.

Single-medium school: A school like those above in which only English-medium classes are conducted, OR in which only Afrikaans-medium classes are conducted, in contrast to parallel-medium, dual-medium or double-medium schools in which pupils of both language groups are members of one school and share certain activities.

Parallel-medium (or parallel) school: A school in which English-speaking children are taught in English in their own classrooms, while Afrikaans-speaking children are taught in Afrikaans in their separate classrooms. Assemblies, games and other general school activities at such schools are conducted in both languages, in turn or otherwise, according to circumstances.





Dual-medium or double-medium school: A school in which pupils of both language groups are instructed together in the same classroom, partly in the one language, partly in the other. Dual-medium organisation was enforced in the Orange Free State for some time after 1906 and in the Transvaal for some time after 1946 in order to foster bilingualism. It is now rarely found outside schools in which children of one language group (or of both) are so few in number that some grouping of classes is economically imperative. A single-standard, double-language grouping, e.g.

Teacher A: English-medium Std. VII plus Afrikaans-medium Std. VII,

Teacher B: English-medium Std. VIII plus Afrikaans-medium Std. VIII, may be preferred to a single-language, double-standard grouping, e.g.

Teacher A: English-medium Standards VII and VIII.

Teacher B: Afrikaans-medium Standards VII and VIII.

Bilingual school: A term sometimes used to include both parallel-medium and dual-medium or double-medium schools.

Mother-tongue education: Education through the medium of the mother-tongue, or home language. Compulsory in the Cape, Transvaal and Orange Free State.





Parental option: The right of the parent in Natal to choose either official language as the medium of his child's instruction.

If English is choosen as medium, Afrikaans must be learnt as a language, and vice versa.





Tables included in text

<u>Subject</u>	<u>Page</u>
Home languages, all races . . . . .	1
White pupils in school, all provinces . . . . .	27
Medium of instruction in Cape Schools, 1924 . . . . .	60
Drift in medium of instruction, 1932-1939 . . . . .	79
Linguistic structure of home environment (1938 survey)	95
Bilingualism in 1936 . . . . .	96
Effect of 'wrong' medium on scores in English and Afrikaans . . . . .	98
Comparative attainment in official languages (1938 survey) . . . . .	101
Degrees of sectional discrimination shown (1938 survey)	103
Pupil choices: separate schools or same school for English- and Afrikaans-speaking children	104
Attitudes of students at teacher training colleges . . . . .	106
Drift in medium of instruction, 1932-1939-1946 . . . . .	109
Enrolment by provinces, 1932-1963 . . . . .	111
Scores in Natal survey of 1949 . . . . .	120
Number of Transvaal schools according to medium . . . . .	149
Number of Orange Free State schools according to medium	151
Teachers by home language, 1963 . . . . .	173
Student-teachers by home language, 1963 . . . . .	186
Loan issues, school and provincial libraries . . . . .	228
Religion, Whites, Coloured and Africans, 1960 . . . . .	238





Tables supplementary to text

<u>Table</u>	<u>Subject</u>	<u>Follows page</u>
A	Number of pupils according to medium of instruction and control of school, 1947-1963 . . . . .	163
B	Number of pupils according to medium of instruction, standard and control of school, 1963 . . . . .	163
C	Number of pupils according to area, medium of instruction, province and control of public schools . . . . .	163
L	a) Bilingualism of Teachers in Service, b) Home Languages of Teachers, c) Home Languages of Teachers: Percentages	163
D	Teachers according to area, home language and control of school, public schools, 1957-1963	181
E	Teachers according to qualifications and control of school, 1957-1963 . . . . .	181
F	Drop-out of pupils according to standard from Std. VI to X, and medium of instruction. Number and per cent, all schools, 1955-1963	181
G	Highest school standard passed and diploma and/or degree obtained by home language - percentage distribution. South Africa . . . . .	181



Tables supplementary to text

<u>Table</u>	<u>Subject</u>	<u>Follows page</u>
H	Occupational groups by home language. South Africa. Male . . . . .	181
I	Number of colleges, pupils and teaching staff, full-time and part-time, by sex and control of college, 1962 and 1963 . . . . .	181
J	Number of pupils by standard and medium of instruction, 1963 . . . . .	181
K	Permanent staff . . . . .	181
M	Summary of colleges, students and lectures, 1957-1963 . . . . .	191
N	Colleges according to sex of students, medium of instruction and enrolment size group - 1957-1963 . . . . .	191
O	Full-time students according to year of course and sex, 1957-1963 . . . . .	191
P	Full-time students according to age and sex, 1963 . . . . .	191
Q	Summary of colleges, students and lectures, 1963 . . . . .	191
R	Colleges according to sex of students, medium of instruction and enrolment size group, 1963	191
S	Full-time students according to year of course and sex, 1963 . . . . .	191





Tables supplementary to text

<u>Table</u>	<u>Subject</u>	<u>Follows page</u>
T	Students according to home language, 1963	191
U	Assistance to students, 1963 . . . .	191
V	Lecturers according to home language, sex and nature of appointment, 1963 . .	191
W	Lecturers according to home language, sex and nature of appointment, 1957-1963 . .	191
X	Intelligence quotients of 1963, intake of new students - Transvaal Training Colleges	191
Y	Principal subjects taken by pupils from Stds. VI to X, including adaptation class, by medium of instruction, number and per cent - public schools, 1963 . . . .	230
Z	Principal subjects taken by pupils from Stds. VI to X, including adaptation class, by medium of instruction, number and per cent - public schools, 1963 . . . .	230





Brief Resumé of Report

Introductory

South Africa's population of 18 million - White, Coloured, African, Asian. Languages spoken. The different waves of migration. Expansion of White rule. Role of White groups in modern industrialisation and urbanisation. Value of bilingualism in a country where speakers of the two official languages are not geographically separated but are generally interspersed in all major areas of White population.

I.

Surveys the fortunes of English and Dutch in the Cape Colony from 1652 till 1910.

a) 1652-1805. The period of the Dutch in the Cape Company (1652-1795) and the Batavian Republic (1803-1805). Discouragement of French of Huguenots by Company. Character of education in Company period. Educational and other plans of Commissioner-General de Mist.

b) 1805-1910. Smallness of population at time of annexation. Dutch and Afrikaans. Policy of anglicisation. British social policies. Reaction against these. Land hunger. Trek of border farmers. State schools. System of aided schools. Powers of local school committees. Right (1865) to provide for instruction through medium of Dutch not made use of.



English dominant. Opposing forces. Inertia of submerged.  
Genootskap van Regte Afrikaners. Afrikaner nationalism after  
 Jameson Raid and Anglo-Boer War. Foundation of Zuid-Afrikaanse  
 Onderwysersunie.

## II.

Surveys the position of Dutch and English in the schools  
 of the Transvaal, Orange Free State and Natal until 1910. At  
 the end, discusses the English-Dutch relationship on eve of  
 Union.

a) Transvaal. Slow start in education. Unsettled times.  
 Pragmatic approach. Both Dutch and English used as media.  
 Dutch officially sole medium (1882) but this provision not  
 strictly applied. Disagreements between teachers from Holland  
 and those from the Cape. The gold mines and the Uitlanders.  
 Grants for Uitlander schools. Uitlanders and Dutch language.  
 Anglo-Boer War. Schools in concentration camps. Boers establish  
 Christian-National schools. Milner's policy of anglicisation.  
 Selborne's conciliatory policy. Self-government. The Smuts  
 Education Act of 1907. Early mother-tongue instruction.

b) Orange Free State. Good English-Dutch relations until  
 Anglo-Boer War. Milner prescribes English as medium, with  
 instruction in Dutch as language. Christian-National reaction.  
 Compromise of 1905. Hertzog Education Bill of 1908. Litigation.  
 Council Schools. The 1910 settlement.





c) Natal. Early settlements. English immigration of 1849 and provision of state schools. English as medium and Dutch as language generally acceptable. Anglo-Boer War. Action, reaction and settlement in annexed areas.

d) Discussion of English-Dutch relationship on eve of Union (paragraphs 71-76).

### III.

The South Africa Act. The Union of South Africa (31 May 1910). The Provincial Councils and education. English and Dutch official languages entitled to equal treatment (Article 137). The language question raised in Parliament. Provincial legislation reviewed in light of Article 137. Parliamentary debate: compulsory mother-tongue education v. parental option, and compulsory v. voluntary learning of second language. Practical inequalities of English and Dutch in South African conditions. Adjustments in Transvaal and Orange Free State on basis of compulsory mother-tongue education for first six school years; thereafter parental option. Adjustment in Natal on basis of parental option. Difficulties in way of compulsion in Cape. Langenhoven pleads for Afrikaans instead of Dutch.

### IV.

The Dutch v. Afrikaans debate. Conservatism of church and school. Afrikaans makes headway. Langenhoven's resolution in Cape Provincial Council in favour of Afrikaans accepted (April 1914). Similar resolution accepted in Free State; and in





Transvaal. Mixed reception at first by Afrikaans teachers' societies; soon strong support. Rapid transition from Dutch to Afrikaans in schools. Position in 1924. The Church accepts Afrikaans. The Dutch Reformed Church and separate Christian-National schools. The National Party's 'two-stream' policy. Mother-tongue debate resumed. Compulsion extended to eighth school year. Definitive recognition of Afrikaans by Parliament (Act No. 8 of 1925).

## V.

1925-1939. Urbanisation. Integration of 'poor Whites' into modern economy. 'Civilised labour'. Contribution made by education. The Afrikaners increasingly townsmen. School adjustments: parallel classes - advantages and disadvantages. Attitude of teachers' societies. Parallel-medium v. single-medium debate. Increasing popularity of Afrikaans as medium illustrated statistically (p. 79). General Hertzog pleads for a 'consolidated South African nation'. Reaction of separatist Afrikaner organisations: the Broederbond; the F.A.K. Positive work of F.A.K. Its divisive influence. The Institute for Christian-National Education.

## VI.

Summarises results of Bilingualism Survey conducted in 1938 by Dr. E.G. Malherbe. Malherbe's 'six stages of practical bilingualism'. The schools in 1938, single-, parallel- and dual-medium. The purpose of the survey: to study degree of



bilingualism; factors determining linguistic growth, e.g. intelligence, home environment, influences outside the home, the school, the type of school organisation; the influence of medium on attainment a) in the two languages and b) on progress in other subjects; also the vocational value of bilingualism. Linguistic structure of home environment. Many homes bilingual. Effect of instruction in 'wrong' medium. Language achievement as influenced by school organisation. Social attitudes in single-medium and bilingual schools; in training-college students. Comments on Survey.

## VII.

Medium of instruction by provinces, 1932-1939-1946. Reasons for increasing Afrikaans-medium enrolments. Industrialisation swells Transvaal enrolments and, to lesser extent, Natal's. The Second World War brings division. General Smuts, Prime Minister. Parliamentary resolution on use of second language as supplementary medium to 'make ideals of bilingualism and national unity in the schools fully effective.' Provincial Ordinance No. 23 of 1942 in Natal provides for teaching ( $\frac{1}{2}$  hour to 1 hour daily) through medium of second language. Assessment of results in 1949. Effect of lessons through second medium. Effect of school organisation. Effect of general environment. Experimental approach in Cape Province. Effects of teacher attitudes; and of pupil attitudes. Transvaal Education Amendment Ordinance of 1945. Its far-reaching provisions. Lukewarm support and vehement opposition. Amending Ordinance





of 1948. National Party gains control of Parliament (1948) and of Transvaal Provincial Council (1949). Ordinance of 1949 reinstates compulsory mother-tongue medium and extends it to include Standard VIII (tenth school year). Natal rescinds dual-medium requirements (1950). Cape terminates experiments.

### VIII.

The Institute for Christian-National Education. The abortive 1944 report. The 1948 policy statement. Its main points. Its reception. Controversy. Authoritative nature of statement. Prof. Coetzee on Christian-National Education. Memorandum of Dutch Reformed Churches on 'divided control' of education. Government action on recommendations.

### IX.

The laws governing medium of instruction. Extension of compulsory mother-tongue medium to Standard VIII in three provinces. Procedures laid down in Chapter IV (Language and Education) of Transvaal Ordinance No. 29 of 1953. Types of school in Transvaal. Procedures laid down in Orange Free State Ordinance No. 16 of 1954. Relevant provisions (chapter 17) of Cape Ordinance No. 20 of 1956. Provision for parental option in Natal (Section 11 (1) of Ordinance No. 23 of 1942). Departmental safeguards. Bilingualism of teachers. Natal and the parallel-school principle. Requirements for introduction of second medium, and of secondary classes. New city schools single-medium: reasons. The Natal record. Non-provincial vocational schools.



X.

Instruction in the second language. Compulsory in all provinces. Typical time allocations. The teacher: class teacher, or specialist. Degree of bilingualism expected of pupils at various stages. Incidental learning: assemblies, school singing, playing fields.

XI.

The teaching establishment. Pupil: teacher ratios. Professional qualifications of teachers. Shortages: teachers of Afrikaans, English, Mathematics and physical science. Preponderance of Afrikaans-speaking teachers: Afrikaans, English, Other, in percentages 74.1, 23.0, 2.9. Low masculinity of English-speaking corps. Effects of this shortage. Reasons. Socio-economic status and vocational expectations. Other reasons.

XII.

Training of teachers. Requirements for admission to teachers' colleges and universities. Training of secondary teachers. Training of primary teachers. Medium at university. Bilingual requirements. Medium of teachers' colleges. Masculinity. Teachers' college staffs: home languages, masculinity. Bilingual requirements for certification. Criticisms of university preparation of language teachers. Need for appreciation of 'other' cultural values.





XIII.

Appointments and promotions of teachers. Centralised system in Natal. Advantages and limitations. Role of bilingualism. Bonus for bilingualism. Local interest. School boards and school committees in other provinces. Cape procedures. Free State procedures. Transvaal procedures. Dissatisfaction with powers of school committees. Allegations of preference on non-professional grounds. Religious preference.

XIV.

Teachers' organisations. Separate organisations for all cultural groups. Provision for co-operation. Parallelism in South African life generally. The Afrikaans and English organisations: in Transvaal, in the Cape, in Natal. Educational and social outlook of the English organisations. Of the Afrikaans organisations. Reservations. Prejudice conveyed by infection. Affiliations with the F.A.K. The Sons of England. The Abe Bailey Trust. The National Advisory Education Council.

XV.

Biculturalism and the curriculum. Time devoted to language teaching. Effect on main language. Losses offset by advantages of bilingualism. Little room for classical or foreign languages. Evaluations in literature. Slanted teaching of history. Auerbach's study of textbooks. Libraries. School broadcasting.



XVI.

Biculturalism and the Non-White schools. Historical role of English. The 1937 F.A.K. congress. Other views on role of Afrikaans. Prof. B.F. Nel - Christian-National policy. African education and the missions. African education taken over by Bantu Affairs Department. Some effects. Language policies. Digression on Afrikaans and apartheid. The Transkeian Commission. Delayed expansion of secondary education. Isolationism at university level. Coloured education. Indian education.





## INTRODUCTORY

### SOUTH AFRICA A MULTIRACIAL, MULTICULTURAL AND MULTILINGUAL COUNTRY

1. The population of the Republic of South Africa has been officially estimated, as at mid-year 1965, to number approximately 18 million people. Those registered as of European descent (officially, the 'Whites') were just under  $3\frac{1}{2}$  million; those of ethnically mixed parentage (officially, the 'Coloureds') were  $1\frac{3}{4}$  million; those of Asian descent (officially, the 'Asiatics') were  $\frac{1}{2}$  a million; and the 'descendants of the indigenous African tribes' (officially, the 'Bantu') were just over 12 million.

2. These people speak many different tongues. The latest available figures for language distribution are those of the census of 1960, when the total population was 16,002,797 people, made up of 3,088,492 Whites, 1,509,258 Coloureds, 477,125 Asians and 10,927,922 Africans. Their home languages, as recorded in the 1960 census, were as set out below<sup>1</sup>.

#### HOME LANGUAGE: 1960

3.	<u>Whites</u>	
	Afrikaans	1,790,988
	English	1,150,738
	Both Afrikaans and English	44,866
	German	32,654
	Netherlands Dutch	22,554
	Other	46,692

---

1. Statistical Year Book, 1964, pp. A-21,22.



4. Details of the 'other' home languages are not available for 1960. In 1951 the other language total was 30,946 and included 9,970 speakers of Yiddish, 4,844 of Greek, 4,206 of Italian, 3,775 of Portuguese and 2,861 of French.

5. Coloureds

Afrikaans	1,336,974
English	153,974
Both Afrikaans and English	13,662
Other	4,648

6. The Coloured people, as a distinct <sup>2</sup> South African population group, came into being in the Western Cape Province in the days of the Dutch East India Company, where their language became Afrikaans <sup>3</sup>. The Cape Province is still the home of the great majority of the Coloured people, though many have moved elsewhere in search of employment, notably to the Transvaal and Natal. In course of time, other ethnic strains have joined the Coloured group in all Provinces. There is some tendency for Coloured people of the better-off urban classes to prefer to speak English but this tendency is held in check by the education laws.

7. Asians

Afrikaans	7,389
English	64,484
Both Afrikaans and English	1,384
Other	<u>403,868</u>
	477,125

---

2. There are broad border-lines along which classification creates difficult personal problems.

3. See paragraphs 15-17.





8. Under 'other', in 1951, the total given was 336,596, including 120,181 speakers of Tamil, 89,145 of Hindi, 39,495 of Gujarati, 30,210 of Telugu, 25,455 of Urdu, 26,090 of other Indian languages and 4,738 of Chinese. All but a small fraction of South Africa's Asian population are thus of Indian descent. Their lingua franca and their main educational language (except in respect of Hindu and Muslim religious instruction) has generally been English.

9.	<u>Africans</u>	
	Xhosa	3,044,634
	Zulu	2,867,177
	South Sotho	1,282,544
	Tswana	1,148,899
	Sepedi	971,427
	Shangaan	511,093
	Swazi	334,310
	Ndebele	294,253
	Venda	245,829
	Other and unspecified	<u>227,756</u>
		10,927,922

10. Before the arrival of the Europeans, these African languages had not been committed to writing. African education, until the present century, was predominantly a missionary enterprise and its major language, beyond the elementary stages, was English. The African languages of course remained the everyday speech of the African peoples and they have been cultivated educationally as more and more of the people have become literate. African secondary education and, even more, university education, is



still conducted to a considerable extent through the medium of English, though the vernaculars are playing increasingly important parts and the use of Afrikaans as medium is being systematically promoted by the Government.

11. South Africa is thus a multiracial, multicultural and multilingual country. Let us consider briefly how it came to be like that.

12. Until about five or six hundred years ago, South Africa would seem to have been populated very sparsely, and its inhabitants were of the Bushman or Hottentot types, now largely absorbed in other groups and, in pure form, found only in isolated, semi-desert areas. The major ethnic groups now resident in South Africa are all comparatively recent immigrants.

13. Of these groups, the first to arrive were the pastoral African tribes (the 'Bantu'), who began to migrate southwards from East and Central Africa from about the fifteenth century. Outside the central and western parts of the present Cape Province, these Bantu tribes formed the main body of indigenous inhabitants of the area now known as the Republic of South Africa when they first made contact with the second, White group of migrants towards the end of the eighteenth century.

14. The White, and associated Coloured, migrants. These White migrants were frontier pastoralists moving northwards and eastwards from the south-western Cape where the Dutch East India Company, in 1652, had set up a refreshment station which had





gradually developed into a wider and more permanent settlement. White settlers in the Company's time were predominantly <sup>4</sup> Dutch but they included a substantial proportion of Germans, one considerable group of French Huguenots, some Scandinavians and others.

15. But the Whites were not alone at the Cape. They had found, and traded with, indigenous Hottentot pastoralists. They imported slaves in substantial numbers from various regions of Africa and Asia. A small group of political exiles from the Dutch East Indies brought yet another strain. To these have been added, over the years, the children of marriages or irregular associations of White men with non-White women. A common lot and a common language were to weld these diverse elements into the 'Coloured' group, though the group was to continue to include many diverse types.

16. The Afrikaans language emerges. In this ethnically and linguistically heterogeneous community, living for the most part remote from educational institutions, Dutch was the dominant language. But Cape Dutch soon ceased to be the Dutch of Holland. The language was so modified, phonetically and grammatically, that it emerged as a new language, Afrikaans, basically Germanic in its vocabulary, but simplified structurally in daily give-and-take between the Dutch-speaking and the alien groups, all expressing themselves as best they could in Dutch without much benefit of schooling.

---

4. 50 per cent Dutch, 27 per cent German, just over 17 per cent French and 5½ per cent 'other', according to Colenbrander in Afkomst der Boeren. Most of the Germans had been in the Company's service and had a working knowledge of Dutch on arrival.





17. While Afrikaans was established as the spoken language of the Cape settlement, bond and free, by the end of the eighteenth century, it was not until the twentieth century that the majority of its White speakers ceased to regard it as a debased form of the Dutch of the Netherlands and began to recognise in it an independent language with its own patterns and its own standards. It was still Dutch, and not Afrikaans, that was entrenched as official language - on a basis of equality of treatment with English - by the National Convention which drew up the constitution for the Union of South Africa in 1909. Afrikaans attained full recognition by Act of Parliament only in 1925. The Afrikaans Bible came only in 1937. Throughout the nineteenth century, speakers of Afrikaans considered Dutch to be their 'proper' language, and Dutch remained the language of the church and the language in which most Afrikaners essayed to conduct their public affairs and their correspondence - if they did not make use of English for these purposes.

18. From the time of the Napoleonic wars onwards, the English language was to play an increasingly important role in South Africa. During these wars, the English took over the Cape from the dying East India Company. They returned it to the revolutionary Batavian Republic, and in 1806 took it back again, this time to keep it until the setting up of the Union of South Africa in 1910.

19. Under British Governors, immigrants came in considerable numbers from the United Kingdom. Many settled in and around Cape



Town, but the Eastern Cape and, later, Natal were the areas in which British settlers, from the beginning, made up the majority of the White farming community, as well as of the townspeople. In 1822 notice was given that English, by stages, was to be made the official language of the Cape. The Dutch had ceded the Colony to Britain in 1814 and the Dutch political connection was gone. The Dutch language was very much a book language (often the language of 'the Book'). The Afrikaners considered Afrikaans unfitted for serious business of church and state, and there was no obvious reason why others should esteem it more highly. It had not yet been seriously reduced to writing. In the circumstances, it was inevitable that English should, for a time, completely dominate the educational scene. It even seemed likely to become the only medium of instruction in the schools. But in the Cape and over South Africa as a whole the English-speaking were to remain a minority of the White population and a small minority of the total population. Later events were to bring a reaction against anglicisation and to stimulate a strong Afrikaner group sentiment, and South Africa was to recognize two official languages on a basis of equal treatment.

20. From the 1830s, White settlement spread beyond the boundaries of the Cape Colony. Following on the emancipation of the slaves and other unpopular legislation in the field of race relations by the British Government at the Cape, and in search of new land for their extensive pastoral farming operations, some thousands of Dutch farmers trekked away from the Colony and founded ultimately the republics of the Transvaal and





the Orange Free State. These farmers' republics were overwhelmingly Dutch-speaking, or rather, Afrikaans-speaking, until after the discovery of diamonds and gold from the 1860s, when large numbers of immigrants flowed into the country to work on the mines or in the associated industries and transport services. As education had been comparatively undeveloped in the republics, industrial know-how had to be imported and the new mining towns became very largely the homes of an immigrant population, English-speaking by birth or by adoption. And by and large, up to the time of Union the Afrikaners remained characteristically countrymen and the English-speaking townsmen.

21. The past half-century has brought increasingly rapid industrialisation and urbanisation. While the White rural population of South Africa fell from 517,000 in 1904 to 507,000 in 1960, the White urban population rose in the same period from 599,000 to 2,582,000. Like his English-speaking compatriot, the typical Afrikaner is today a townsman. And while some cities are predominantly English-speaking and some predominantly Afrikaans, all cities contain substantial proportions of both linguistic groups. There is no part of South Africa where English is the sole official language, and no part where Afrikaans is. This situation creates problems of adaptation differing in many respects from those which arise in bilingual countries where each language is practically and officially supreme in its own territory.

22. Before closing this introductory section, reference must be made to the third sizable ethnic group to immigrate into South



Africa in historical times. The comparatively small Indian community was recruited, for the most part, by the Natal Government between 1860 and the end of the century to provide labour for Natal's industries, and notably for the rapidly developing sugar industry. The Indian population has become highly urbanised, now forming the largest ethnic group in Durban and a large part of the population of most Natal towns. They have made particularly rapid strides in education in the years since the Second World War, using English as medium.

23. While South Africa is a land of many languages, the two languages of the dominant White group, English and Afrikaans, are the two official languages of the whole country, the other languages having informal recognition only in limited spheres. Bilingualism, in South Africa, means officially the ability to use both the official languages. In the following sections we shall discuss the adaptations of the South African educational system for Whites to this bilingual situation, remembering, of course, that non-White education is also affected. We shall now retrace our steps a little and discuss the position of these two languages, first, and briefly, in the Dutch period, and then in the century between 1805, when the English took possession of the Cape Colony, and 1910, when the four Colonies (the Cape of Good Hope, Natal, Transvaal and the Orange Free State) came together as Provinces of the Union of South Africa.





Dutch and English in the Cape Colony  
from 1652 to 1910.

a) 1652 - 1805

24. Linguistically speaking, the history of the Cape settlement and subsequently of the Cape Colony can be divided into a Dutch period, lasting from the establishment of the Cape refreshment station in 1652 till the British occupation of the Cape in 1806, and a period of English language predominance lasting from 1806 till the establishment of Union in 1910. The years since Union have seen the evolution of a state of comparative equilibrium between the two languages.

25. The Dutch language came to South Africa as the language of the Dutch East India Company. While people from Holland, in the early days of settlement, were only half of the White population, and a minority of the total population, their language was the language of government and the language most generally understood by all the White colonists and, gradually, by the inhabitants of other races whose livelihood depended on the colonists. By the end of the period of Company rule Dutch, in its new Cape form, had become the language of all groups in the territories under Company control at the Cape.

26. The German settlers had been easily assimilated. Many of them came from parts of Germany near the Dutch





frontier where the local speech was in some ways closer to Dutch than to High German: many, before coming to the Cape, had been for years in the service of the Company elsewhere.

27. The French Huguenot settlers of 1688 were the only immigrant group in Company days who ever seemed likely to maintain their home language in their new country. But Company policy was against such maintenance. When the French, soon after their arrival, applied for their own local government and church council they were warned to refrain in future from such impertinent requests. Resolutions of the Company's Council of Seventeen in the years following express unambiguously the Council's policy of bringing the French language into disuse. How viable French would have proved at the Cape had the Company's policy been more indulgent it is difficult to assess. The French made up only one-sixth of the settlement. Bonds of religion united them to their Dutch neighbours in South Africa rather than to the French of their country of origin. There is no evidence that the change of language left any feeling of resentment.

28. Education, in the Company's time, had a strongly religious character. In the older, more closely settled areas, the sieckentroosters ministered to the sick



as well as instructing the young and preparing them for confirmation. In the more remote areas, education of a limited kind was given by itinerant teachers of various extraction and of generally inferior qualifications. Practically throughout the period, even in Cape Town, education did not go beyond a very elementary level.

29. Control of the Cape passed from the Dutch East India Company in 1795, when Britain for the first time occupied the Colony. It was returned to Holland ('the Batavian Republic') by the Treaty of Amiens in 1803, and there was a further, though brief, period of Dutch rule which was made memorable by the educational plan prepared by Commissioner-General J.A. de Mist. It was an advanced plan for 1803, providing for a state system of education on a colony-wide basis, the foundation of a training college for teachers, modern courses of study, taxation for educational purposes and a controlling Board of Education. But it was inspired by much of the spirit and many of the ideas of the French Revolution and was not well received in a colony whose social structure, religious beliefs, and educational backwardness made it inhospitable to new ideas.

30. According to Theal 5 'the government of the





Batavian Republic was as different from the Dutch East India Company as light from darkness. One had in view the benefit of a distant commercial association, the other the development of the country for its own advantage as well as for that of the fatherland.' De Mist had proposals in the field of race relations, or master-servant relations (the two practically coincided), which would have been strongly opposed by the farmers. Similar provisions became a major cause of disaffection against Britain when introduced by later British governors. In the field of English-Dutch relations it is a major misfortune that reforms, necessary and inevitable in the nineteenth century and envisaged by de Mist, should have made little impact during his brief tenure of office and should later, when introduced by British governors, have been interpreted as evidence of British partiality for the non-Whites and hostility to the Whites.

31. The major immediate objection to de Mist's plan for education was its secular nature, and it is clear that the plan would have run into heavy opposition. It could have brought great educational development. But it was not given time to prove itself. De Mist left the colony in 1804. War again broke out and in January 1806 Britain re-occupied the Cape.



## b) 1806 - 1910

32. When the British resumed occupation of the Cape in 1806, the total population of the settlement was about 70,000, of whom about 26,000 were White persons. Dutch had been the language of government, of the courts, of the church, of the civil service. But the language of the general population had been Dutch in its African form, 'Kaaps' (Cape Dutch - the name 'Afrikaans' was not yet in use), which was regarded by the educated as a vulgar dialect.

33. And to the ear attuned to the traditional concords of Dutch, 'Kaaps' must indeed have sounded, in comparison, formless and uncultivated. Consider, for example, its general elimination of grammatical gender, or its general elimination of verb endings denoting person and number, as in:

Present tense : verb 'to be'

	<u>Singular</u>	<u>Plural</u>
1.	ek <u>is</u>	ons <u>is</u>
2.	jy <u>is</u>	julle <u>is</u>
3.	hy) sy) <u>is</u> dit)	hulle <u>is</u>

34. With the advantage of hindsight, now that Afrikaans is not only fully recognised but also the language of the political establishment, it is easy to point out that the early Dutch and Afrikaans critics were wrong



in condemning one language, Afrikaans, for not following the grammatical patterns of another language, Dutch. One does not condemn English because its grammar is no longer that of Anglo-Saxon, or French, because its grammar is no longer that of Latin. But the early critics of Afrikaans did not see in Afrikaans a language used in Parliament, in universities and courts of law. It was as little vouchsafed to them to foresee a hundred years into the future as it is vouchsafed to us to see the South Africa of 2066. What they saw was a rural vernacular not yet seriously committed to paper and spoken on public occasions only by the illiterate or semi-literate. It seemed to them that if Dutch were to be preserved in South Africa, it must be 'proper Dutch', Dutch in its cultivated Netherlands form. It was, and remained until much spade work with Afrikaans had been done, an entirely reasonable assessment of the situation. In another sense too the early Afrikaners were only being realistic in regarding Afrikaans as an inferior medium for the expression of elevated or precise thought. A language is as cultivated as its speakers. Afrikaans could become a cultivated language only when Afrikaners of education and standing began to use it seriously for the purposes of their professions and of literature and science. In the nineteenth century most Afrikaners of education and standing would have scorned to do that, and so the potentialities





of Afrikaans for a long time remained unrealised.

35. The English governors thus found in the new colony a small population with an official language which no one recognised as a language at all. This circumstance greatly facilitated the development of the new government's plans to make English the sole official language of the Colony, now part of the British Empire. And English gained ground rapidly, and gained ground continuously, until the educated Afrikaners, more than a century\*after the British occupation, turned from Dutch - by then more foreign to them than English - and set seriously about the business of using and developing Afrikaans for all the purposes of a modern community.

36. For a long time it seemed as if the policy of making English the general language of the Colony would be crowned with success. The patronage of the state was in English hands, and a knowledge of English was made compulsory for appointments to the public service. The teachers imported from England for the free schools opened up in the chief urban centres were of a higher quality than the 'meesters' of Company days<sup>6</sup>. Vacant pulpits in the Dutch Reformed Church were filled by young clergymen from Scotland, most of whom were men

---

6. Malherbe, E.G. : Education in South Africa, 1652-1922, p.58.

\* But see paragraph 46 for an earlier movement.



of considerable ability. For reasons which have been given, Dutch was very vulnerable.

37. But the anglicising process was not to go without opposition. It was associated with unpopular social policies, some of which had been foreshadowed by de Mist. In 1928 Ordinance 50 swept away all the Hottentot pass laws and gave free persons of colour the right to move about in search of higher wages, permission to hold land - if they could get it - and other rights. In 1834 the slaves became apprentices, and in 1838 they were freed. These were but two major features of a series of social enactments which must have been made under any Western government in the nineteenth century but which caused resentment in those who had vested interests in the old system. Dislike of the new legislation and suspicion of the 'foreign' government reinforced one another. In the border areas these attitudes stirred up still further that chronic restlessness caused by land hunger and shortage of occupiable land which was to lead, in the late 'thirties, to the 'Great Trek' of some thousands of Dutch farmers away from the confines of the colony, and to the establishment of Trekker republics to the north.

38. 'This period', writes Dr. E.G. Malherbe <sup>7</sup>, 'saw the unfortunate beginnings of an antagonism towards English

---

7. Year Book of Education, 1932, p. 629.





rule and the English language which has retarded progress in general, and the educational progress in particular, of the two White races in South Africa up to very recent times; and many of the educational problems which emerged subsequently can be traced to this very period.'

39. The Afrikaners of the Cape found the new English state schools too secular in spirit. In the country communities in particular many parents had regarded education as primarily the business of preparing children for confirmation, and the reigns of the kings and queens of England, as set out in the new syllabuses, seemed to have less relevance to their children's eternal salvation than the stories of the kings of Israel, as learnt for the old meesters, and even less relevance to their everyday life in Africa. After preliminary success, the state schools became unpopular, and a more extensive system of aided schools, to be reorganised at various times in the course of the century, took its place.

40. The local committees had certain powers, including, after 1865, the power to provide for instruction in Dutch as a subject. Until 1882, the medium of instruction had to be English. A law of that year made it possible for a local committee to provide for instruction through the medium of Dutch. But little use was made of that provision. Dr Muir, Superintendent-General of Education in the



Colony, wrote in 1910

'Even in 1892, when I took up office, the state of affairs had not markedly altered. In all town schools and in the great majority of country schools English was then the one medium of instruction, the view of Dutch parents being that the children were sent to school mainly for the purpose of learning English. At the same time European Dutch was a common school subject, the language, however, being often taught merely in the way French used to be taught in English schools. In addition to this it was not at all uncommon to find the Cape colloquial form of Dutch used in country schools for the purposes of explanation.'

41. I illustrate the situation at the end of the nineteenth century by quotations from two writers of different background who reached the same conclusion.

9.

42. In a paper read in English to a students' society at the Dutch-orientated university college in Stellenbosch on 11th March, 1893, C.J. Langenhoven, later the most eloquent champion of Afrikaans, spoke as follows:

'The main argument of the Taalbond, viz., that Dutch was the language of our forefathers and that therefore we ought to re-adopt it, is

8. Memorandum on the Teaching of the English and Dutch Languages in the Cape Province, pp. 1 & 2, quoted in Celliers, D.H.: Die Stryd van die Afrikaanssprekende in Kaapland om sy Eie Skool (1652-1939). Cape Town, 1953.

9. In Na Vyftig Jaar, Gedenkboek van die Unie Debatsvereniging, Stellenbosch. Stellenbosch 1926, p. 111. See paragraph 48 below for Langenhoven's 'explanation' 35 years later.





its worst argument. The fact that Dutch lost the position it had, proves that it was not qualified for that position. And how shall it regain under unfavourable circumstances what it lost under favourable ones? Supposing even that it will regain this position, where is the guarantee that it will this time succeed in holding it, and not once more degenerate into a patois? But even if Dutch had continued what it was, and had been to-day what Afrikander Dutch is, then other circumstances being what they are, our consideration for the welfare of our country should have induced us to abolish it and adopt English instead. English is now virtually a universal language, its literature is studied and admired by all civilised countries, it forms the commercial medium of the whole world; and, what should be a more weighty consideration, it belongs to us by right as British subjects, as part of the British nation.'

'To a stranger, English is more helpful in Holland than Dutch is in any country outside of Holland, excepting the few Dutch Colonies and South Africa. In our opinion no greater injustice could be done to our country than by forcing upon us a worthless and insignificant language, especially after it has clearly been shown that the rising generation takes to English more easily and appreciates it more readily than Dutch. The taste of the elder classes is no consideration, for we look to the future, when they shall have made room for those that are now young.'

'There is a third competitor, namely Afrikander Dutch. Among its advocates the most prominent parties are certain inhabitants of the Paarl, whose love for the language in which they have been brought up makes one entertain the suspicion that their filial feelings have been better attended to than their education ...'

'There has been some discussion as to whether Afrikander Dutch is an independent language or a dialect. To me it appears that this can make no difference to the question. A good dialect is better than a bad language; and the qualifications of Afrikander Dutch for the position of national language will depend not upon its greater or lesser individuality, but upon its intrinsic qualities, and upon circumstances. Now, would these justify the adoption of Afrikander Dutch as a national





language? For intellectual training Africander Dutch offers no scope, for it has no literature, and a very poor vocabulary. For internal intercourse and as a trade-medium, English is superior to it; and for foreign trade, it stands nowhere. At the close we repeat our heading and ask, "what shall be the future language of South Africa?" It may not be out of place here to consider how very convenient the peculiar character of Cape Dutch renders the acquisition of English...'

'Considering moreover that the idiom of Africander Dutch is at least as far removed from that of proper Dutch as from that of English, we are forced to the conclusion that the average speaker of Africander Dutch can more easily acquire English than Dutch.

'It may perhaps be necessary to state that the object of this article is merely to afford exercise for thought, and not to attack or influence or promote any of the three parties. In the writer's opinion, English is powerful enough in itself to fight its own battle, and to gain its own victory.'

43. Two years later, Olive Schreiner <sup>10</sup> wrote:

'In fifty years, fight and struggle against it as we wish, there will be no Boer in South Africa speaking the Taal (Afrikaans), save as a curiosity; only the great English-speaking South African people. The movement cannot be hindered, it cannot be stayed, it is inevitable.'

44. Fifty years were to show the emergence of forces unsuspected by either writer.

45. Before passing to more conscious forces, one must mention the powerful force of inertia. On the Dutch-speaking countryside, parents might see to it that their



children learnt English at school, but the language of the home usually remained Afrikaans, though it might be an Afrikaans larded with English words. Even in the most anglicised home, the language spoken to and by the servants remained Afrikaans. Because of the enormous distance and the existence of many very poor areas, educational facilities could only gradually be extended. Like other countries where master and servant meant largely White and non-White, South Africa had developed a large class of poor Whites, Whites living more or less at subsistence level on small piece of land, or working for shares, or even as labourers (in a land where labourers' pay is low) on the lands of other men. Many Whites had little schooling and were thus 'saved from anglicisation by their poverty.' There were, it is true, mission schools for the poor, but these schools were then usually open to White and Coloured without distinction, which made them unattractive to many poor Whites. But even mission schools did not reach the great mass of the Coloured people (compulsory education is not yet generally applicable to Coloured children, except in Natal) and they were also saved from the same 'fate'. Afrikaans as typically spoken by Coloured people differed from typical White Afrikaans mainly in intonation, but also in minor aspects of vocabulary. The differences were such as one might find in different social classes in the same community. They did





not hinder understanding, and they did not always coincide with the colour line. The Coloured community was a great but unappreciated reserve of the Afrikaans language.

46. But a more active resistance to the anglicising pressures gradually became articulate. In the church, and among the more educated families (particularly those with some connection with Holland), several movements had arisen with the object of revitalising and perpetuating the Dutch language and traditions in South Africa. Then in 1875 the Genootskap van Regte Afrikaners (Association of True Afrikaners) was formed, with the object: 'To stand for our Language, our Nation and our Country.' The language, in this case, was Afrikaans, and the date is therefore a significant one in South African history.

47. Between the champions of Dutch and the champions of Afrikaans there was often more friction than was good for either cause. What in the end gave them a sense of serving a common cause was the tremendous wave of 'nationalist' feeling which was aroused in Afrikaners everywhere in the years after the Jameson Raid, and, more particularly, as a reaction against the long-drawn-out miseries of the Anglo-Boer War. Many Afrikaners in the Cape and Natal sympathised with the two republics from the beginning. The number of rebels from these two colonies who joined the Boer forces is evidence of that.



By the end of the War most Cape and Natal Afrikaners had come to a new realisation of national identity with their fellows in the devastated republics. There was disenchantment with the Empire. There was resentment of a noisy local jingoism which - in a war which was not the finest hours of the British people - tended to treat all Afrikaners as inferiors and as potential, if not actual, traitors. Many educated Afrikaners took a fresh look at the years which lay behind in which they had tried to adapt themselves to the reigning English culture. They were in a mood to reassess the situation. And the less educated masses were in a mood to listen to new voices.

48. One who made such a reassessment was the C.J. Langenhoven quoted in paragraph 42 above. Long afterwards (in 1927) he was to go back to his old student society and 'explain' his paper of 1893. After references to the changes in the world at large in the intervening  
11  
35 years, he continued

'And if we turn our eyes from the great world to our own country, how great have been the changes which have taken place in the 35 years. We also had our war in that period. And we thought that we had lost it. "But", the Lord said, "my ways are not your ways". Today we see that we did not lose the war, but won it. For here we are this evening free citizens in a free land, with our own language, our own Government, our own independence, subordinate to no other authority on earth.

---

11. Aan Stille Waters, 1932, Cape Town, pp. 373-4. (Translated).





'So much for the material change. But it is the spiritual and not the material that rules the world. With the external change in our circumstances there has also come a spiritual change. In the course of that 35 years we discovered our own soul. When I was a member of this Society its official language was English. By way of exception we had an occasional debate in Dutch. I have taken part in such a debate myself, in High Dutch, so called because it was neither High nor Dutch ... In my classes and lectures everything, except in the lectures on the Dutch language, was in English. The atmosphere and the outlook were English. The only ideal which I could hold before me was an unattainable ideal - an impossible counsel of perfection. And that was that I, since birth a stranger in my own country, should be able to acquire sufficient English speech and English ways of thought to become the equal of my competitor and superior, the student of English birth. That is the explanation of the paper from which your chairman has quoted. That is why I said in it that Afrikaans was unfit for the highest spiritual and scientific expression. And, wrong as I was, did I not have reason for what I said? Only after that time, and much later, have we subjected our language to the highest tests and have we discovered that it meets all demands completely. Our lectures are now given in our own language, to the highest levels; our science finds it adequate for its most stringent requirements. We have stood at the cradle of a new literature ...'

49. But that is anticipating. The first notable indication of the new spirit in the educational field was the breaking away of Dutch teachers from the predominantly English 'South African Teachers' Association' and their establishment, in 1905, of the 'Zuid Afrikaanse Onderwijzers-Unie' (now, in Afrikaans, the S.A.O.U.). The new organisation favoured mother-tongue education in the early years.





The 'mother-tongue' they pleaded for in the case of the Afrikaans-speaking child was still Dutch, not Afrikaans. But when the Cape entered Union with the other Provinces in 1910 its schools were still overwhelmingly English in language and character.



## II

Dutch and English in the Schools of the  
Transvaal, Orange Free State and Natal  
until 1910

(a) The Transvaal

50. There were differences of opinion about the respective places of Dutch and English in the Transvaal when it was still essentially a colony of Afrikaner farmers ('Boere'), i.e., before the discovery of gold in 1884 brought a rush of heterogeneous but mainly English-speaking immigrants. Such differences very often had their origins in the different outlooks and different interests of teachers imported from Holland, on the one hand, and teachers trained in the Cape Colony, on the other. Generally speaking, the Transvaal farmers had an essentially pragmatic approach to the education of their children and appreciated the practical usefulness of a knowledge of English. Education was comparatively backward in the Transvaal, as the following figures<sup>12</sup> indicate:

	White Population	White Pupils in School	Estimated Number of School Age	Number per Thousand of Whites in School
Cape	236,783	19,500	40,000	82.35
Natal	21,045	2,519	3,500	119.69
O.F.S.	50,000	1,006	8,000	20.12
Transvaal	45,000	306	7,000	6.8

---

12. Superintendent Lyle's Report for 1877, quoted in Malherbe, *op.cit.*, p.256. To the figures given should be added an unknown but probably considerable number who had some education from itinerant schoolmasters and a small number sent to schools in the Cape.





As Superintendent Van Gorkum had shown 442 pupils as in attendance at Transvaal schools in 1876, Lyle's figure of 306 for 1877 probably reflects some unsettlement following on Shepstone's annexation of the Transvaal in April 1877. However that may be, it is worth recording here that the Transvaal law of 1874 gave parents the option of choosing Dutch or English as medium for their children's education, and that in 1876, of the eight subsidised schools, four used English as medium (in Pretoria, Heidelberg, Lydenburg and Zeerust), three Dutch (in Pretoria, Potchefstroom and Lydenburg) and one, in Rustenburg, used both languages.

51. During the annexation period of 1877-1881, Superintendent Lyle followed the same tolerant procedure. Malherbe<sup>13</sup> quotes from his Report as follows:

'Bearing in mind the wording of the Proclamation of 12 April, 1877, annexing this country to the British Empire, I cannot conceive that it would be just to make it a rule absolute that English shall be the vehicle of instruction, and it would not fully satisfy the people under existing circumstances to make Dutch the vehicle, and yet to teach the rudiments of knowledge in two languages at the same time seems to me overtaxing young and undeveloped brains. Except in very exceptional cases, such a process must exercise a retarding influence, and children educated under it will not exhibit an average development equalling that to be found where one language only is used in Elementary Education.'

---

13. Op. cit., p.255.



Lyle recommended separate English-medium and Dutch-medium schools, and went on to say that the selection of medium for a particular school

'should not be decided by the Government - or by any authority at a distance, it should be, it must be, decided by those immediately interested, whose children are to be educated at the school they are founding.'

52. After the regaining of independence in 1881 Transvaal education came more strongly under the influence of officials and teachers imported by President Kruger from Holland. In 1882 Dutch was made the sole official medium, but for some time this provision was not strictly applied. At all times English retained an important place on the time-tables. There was some falling-off in the number of subsidy-earning schools and some increase in the number of private schools and in the number of children being sent away to the Cape. And there was tension between the Hollander teachers and the Afrikaner teachers from the Cape who, without being pro-English, showed more awareness of the usefulness of the English language in the public life of South Africa as a whole.

'From a study of educational history', according to an official publication of the Transvaal Education Department<sup>14</sup>, 'it is evident that the Transvaaler, especially in the villages, desired more English to be taught and used in the schools than was permitted in terms of the School Act. And so the Cape

---

14. A.K. Bot, The Development of Education in the Transvaal, 1836-1951. Transvaal Education Department, Pretoria, 1951.





teacher found more points of contact with the community than did the Hollanders.' But these were disagreements within the family, in comparison with the irreconcilable standpoints which were to be taken up by the Transvaal government, on the one hand, and the Uitlander ('foreign') population which was attracted to the newly-opened gold mines in the latter years of the Republic, on the other hand.

53. The Republican government saw itself faced with an 'invasion' of foreigners of such proportions as to threaten to change completely the character of the Republic and the way of life of its citizens. They appreciated the importance of the mining industry in the economic life of the country, and the usefulness of the increased revenues which flowed from mining taxation. But they felt very reasonably that if the newcomers were not to constitute a permanent, and potentially dangerous, foreign body the attempts must be made to assimilate them into the life of the country in which they were making a good living. The Volksraad accordingly made provision in 1892 for grants to be paid to schools where the medium was not Dutch on condition that at least 5 hours per week were devoted to the teaching of Dutch and South African History. From their point of view, it must have seemed a reasonable, even generous, arrangement.





54. It seemed less reasonable to the Uitlander population who were not, generally, concerned to see their children acquire a knowledge of either South African history or the Dutch language; and so few children qualified in the two subjects at the annual inspections that many schools relinquished the government grant on the grounds that it was insufficient to pay the salary of the Dutch teacher<sup>15</sup>. The Uitlanders were not, generally, committed to living indefinitely in the remote and comparatively undeveloped Transvaal republic. Many expected to make money and to return to their home countries. It was natural, in the circumstances, that they should see little benefit for their children in learning the official language of the Transvaal. Their attitude, indeed, would have been quite reasonable if they had not simultaneously demanded all the privileges of Transvaal citizenship.

55. It was estimated in 1895 that, of 6,500 children of school-going age on the Witwatersrand, 2,000 were not attending schools. To meet this need steps were taken from two sides: the government opened up state schools where Dutch was taught and where, in 1898, minimum times for Dutch medium instruction, rising to two-thirds of the time in Standard VI, were prescribed; and the Witwatersrand Council of Education, a new body set up by the Uitlanders with financial support from the mining companies, financed private English schools. In the period between the Jameson Raid (1896) and the Anglo-Boer war (1899-1902) both sides became increasingly committed to their own points of view.

---

15. Malherbe, op. cit., p.279.



56. The schools conducted in the concentration camps during the war and the schools conducted by the Milner regime in the years immediately after must be regarded as part of a general policy of unification through anglicisation. Control was centralised, minimising local and parental influence. English was to be the only medium, and Dutch might be taught for up to three hours a week if requested by the parents. In addition, Bible history and religious instruction (optional subjects) might be taught in the Dutch language, provided that the total time devoted in these ways to Dutch did not exceed 5 hours weekly.

57. While many Afrikaners sent their children to the state schools under these conditions (it was, it seemed, the way to advancement under the new regime), others registered their objection by setting up private 'Christian-National' schools. Once again there were state schools and opposition schools committed to conflicting ideals.

58. In 1905 Lord Milner was succeeded as High Commissioner by Lord Selborne who visited many schools personally and was more conciliatory in the matter of the Dutch language. New regulations issued in December 1905 stipulated<sup>16</sup> that

'teachers shall be allowed to use either the English or Dutch languages as the medium of instruction, so long as they make themselves understood to the children, provided that English shall be used as the medium as soon as the children are able to follow the teacher's instruction in that language. A knowledge of English as prescribed for each Standard shall be a condition of promotion from any Standard to a higher one.'

---

16. Malherbe, op. cit., p.330.





59. While this regulation still prescribed English as medium for all, as soon as they were able to understand lessons in that language, it at least provided for the use of the mother tongue in the early stages while the second language was as yet not understood. The learning of Dutch by English-speaking children remained optional. Selborne gave further satisfaction to the Dutch by restoring a considerable measure of local control in education.

60. In the British general election of 1906, Balfour's Conservative government was defeated and the Liberal government of Campbell-Bannerman took its place. It set up Responsible Government in the Transvaal in December of the same year, and in the Orange River Colony (formerly the Orange Free State) in 1907. In both countries parties led by former Boer generals were returned to power, and the educational picture changed. It was no longer a confrontation of state schools conducted by the conqueror, on the one hand, and of opposition schools conducted by the conquered, on the other. The way was opened for the opposition schools to return to the official system. In the Transvaal the obligation now rested on the new leaders, General Botha as Prime Minister and General Smuts as Minister of Education, to guide the educational system in a way conducive to the welfare and co-operation of both language groups. Smuts's Education Act of 1907 carried Selborne's principle of early mother-tongue instruction a stage further. Dutch children were to be educated in Dutch up to Standard III, when English as



medium might be introduced. Above Standard III the medium was not to be Dutch in more than two subjects. It was, in the circumstances of 1907, a very reasonable piece of legislation. It relieved much inter-racial tension and helped to create an atmosphere favourable to the next great step forward, the coming together of the four colonies in one South African Union.

#### (b) The Orange Free State

61. The Orange Free State - Lord Bryce's 'Model Republic' - was a model state, inter alia, in the matter of the relations between its Dutch and English inhabitants. With an overwhelmingly Dutch population, it employed a Scottish Superintendent of Education for the last twenty-five years of its independent existence, the officer's professional merits being considered more relevant than his national origin. English and Dutch were used as media and taught as languages, and, after an early dispute about the medium at Grey College, with surprisingly little niggling about exactly how much of each.

62. After the Anglo-Boer War education in the Free State (temporarily the Orange River Colony) was subject to the same code of regulations as the Transvaal, with the same prescription of English as medium, and the same provision for the teaching of Dutch. As in the Transvaal, private Christian-National schools were set up in opposition, but most of these joined the state system in 1905 when a compromise was reached in terms of which there was allowed for the teaching of Dutch as a language the same amount of time as was allowed for the teaching of English as a language.





63. Responsible Government in 1907 was followed by General Hertzog's Education Act in 1908 which provided for, inter alia:

- a) education through medium of the home language up to, and including, Standard IV;
- b) the gradual introduction, and use as a subsidiary medium, of the second language;
- c) at least three principal subjects in each Standard from Standard V upwards to be taught through the English medium and at least three principal subjects to be taught through the Dutch medium;
- d) in and after Standard IV, the study of both languages as languages to be compulsory.

64. These regulations aroused much dissatisfaction. Some English parents objected to the compulsion to learn Dutch. More objected to the dual-medium provisions for the higher Standards. There were unilingual teachers and inspectors who saw their prospects and even their security in the service threatened. There were misunderstandings of the somewhat intricate regulations. There were the inevitable difficulties, in a Province where 16,500 out of the 20,000 children were Dutch-speaking, in the way of carrying out a programme of bilingual education with a teaching staff of





whom at least half spoke only English. In the end, there was litigation following on General Hertzog's dismissal of three inspectors of schools<sup>17</sup>. There was a misunderstanding of General Hertzog's views by the Director of Education, who subsequently resigned. Once again, opposition private schools - the 'Council Schools' - were established, this time by English parents.

65. The newly appointed Director of Education made recommendations which were embodied in Act No. 13 of 1910. This Act provided<sup>18</sup>:

As regards medium:

- i) Mother-tongue medium up to and including Standard IV;
- ii) In all Standards above Standard IV, three principal subjects to be taught through the medium of either language.

As regards language instruction:

- i) Below Standard IV, informal instruction in the language which is not the medium;
- ii) From Standard IV, formal instruction in both languages.

66. It was with these provisions in force - embodying equal treatment of English and Dutch - and compulsion to learn both - that the Free State entered Union in the same year.

---

17. The Afrikaners raised a fund to cover General Hertzog's expenses in this litigation. After expenses had been paid there remained a balance which General Hertzog donated to create annual prizes for the encouragement of Afrikaans literature (Die Hertzogprys).

18. Malherbe, op. cit., p.386.



(c) Natal

67. The British settlement in Durban in the years from 1842 was too small to require a school, though it opened the way for missionary work among the Zulus, and several missionaries, notably Lindley, Adams and Grout, who were to render most valuable services in the spread of Christianity and education among the Zulus, arrived in this period. The Trekker Republic of Natalia made no legal provision for public education during its brief existence (1838-1843), but education for church membership continued on the lines customary in the Cape frontier districts and afterwards in the two northern republics.

68. After the annexation of Natal to the Cape in 1843, most of the Trekkers left to rejoin their fellows in the Free State or Transvaal, and Natal's White population, except in the districts of Ladysmith, Newcastle and Umvoti, became in course of time overwhelmingly English-speaking. The first state schools were set up to meet the influx of settlers under the Byrne immigration scheme of 1849 and the medium of instruction was English. It would seem that pressure through the grant system was exercised on some of the early itinerant schools in the Dutch areas to encourage them to teach English, but for most of the colonial period the Afrikaners preferred English as medium to Dutch, while requiring provision for the teaching of Dutch as a subject. This was, for example,





the pattern in the private Huguenot Seminary set up by the Dutch Reformed Church in Greyton<sup>19</sup>. And generally, the Natal government was willing to provide Dutch instruction where it was requested, even if its senior officials were not always so co-operative. Dutch was added to the list of optional subjects in the colony's high schools and, from 1894, to the subjects in the Elementary Examination. In response to a request from the Farmers' Associations of Newcastle, Umvoti and Ladysmith that the next Inspector of Schools to be appointed should be a man with a good knowledge of 'classical Dutch', a Cape Afrikaner had been appointed in 1892.

69. The Anglo-Boer War brought a sharp decrease in the number of pupils taking Dutch in the schools. This was partly a reaction of English-speaking pupils to the war but, according to Dr. Steenkamp<sup>20</sup>, partly because to Afrikaans-speaking children Dutch seemed to be 'a foreign language with no practical value.' After the war, better insight again prevailed and when a Special Inspector of Dutch was appointed in 1908 he found instruction in the Dutch language proceeding in thirty-two schools. But even in 1910 Dutch was being studied by only 1,200 children out of the 17,000 at school<sup>21</sup>.

---

19. L.S. Steenkamp, Onderwys vir Blankes in Natal, 1824-1940. Pretoria, 1941.

20. Op. cit., p. 191.

21. Coetzee, J. Chr. et al: Onderwys in Suid-Afrika, Pretoria, 1958, p.233.



70. As in the other colonies, the end of the war brought action and reaction. The action of the Natal government was the appointment of three unilingual English principals to the three largest schools in the districts annexed from the Transvaal. The reaction was a movement to establish Christian National schools. But concessions in respect of the teaching of Dutch in the state schools affected were followed by the absorption of the children of the C.N.O. schools into the official system.

(d) English and Dutch on the eve of Union

71. Referring back to General Hertzog's language laws in the Orange Free State, it seems desirable at this stage to make some brief remarks about the English-Afrikaner balance of forces on the eve of Union. Ostensibly, after the Anglo-Boer War, the English language was in a position of almost overwhelming strength and the British interest generally dominated the economic and public life of South Africa. True, former Boer generals headed the governments of the former republics, but that did not alter the fact that practically all responsible and middle-range posts in industry and commerce and, as yet, practically all senior public service posts were held by English-speaking people. As a general rule, outside the agricultural field the employers were English-speaking and the Afrikaners were employees, and to be considered for a





responsible post one had normally to speak English with a good accent.<sup>22</sup> All this, of course, did not prevent much overlapping.

72. There were many reasons for the superior position of the English-speaking. To begin with, they had formed the senior official class at the Cape for a century. What was perhaps more important was the fact that British migration to South Africa had generally been selective. The unskilled labourer, rural or urban, avoided South Africa where there was native unskilled labour in superabundance and where wages for unskilled work were, from the European point of view, quite disproportionately low. Such migrants from Britain tended to go to the White colonies, Canada, Australia or New Zealand, where what they had to offer was in greater demand. Most British migrants to South Africa had the general education or the industrial training necessary to assure their employment above the lowest levels in industry, in commerce or in the state service. The domination of their language in the schools made education more accessible to their children than to the Afrikaners - still, until long after Union, a rural people - and they could afford more education. English domination of the trades unions and apprenticeship committees

---

22. This requirement was hard on the Afrikaners but was not solely, or necessarily, an indication of group feeling against them. Speech could also be a handicap to the working-class English child in the highly class-conscious English community of Victorian and Edwardian times.





and of the industrial and commercial houses assured their children better chances of good employment than their competitors. The average per-capita income of the English-speaking group was several times as high<sup>23</sup> as that of the Afrikaans-speaking.

73. The Afrikaners, as a group, seemed destined to take second place. Reference has been made earlier to the existence of the large, submerged 'poor White' group. While there were wealthy and progressive farmers, farming generally was on an extensive, traditional basis and did not yield high financial returns to the average independent farmer. Educationally the Afrikaners were less advanced than their competitors who, being mainly townspeople, usually had schools within easy reach. For a century, there had been the handicap of a home language not yet usable in schools. For too long, and too widely, the tradition had persisted that the basic purpose of education was preparation for church membership, for which a very modest degree of literacy sufficed. In 1898, more than half of the 15,000 children in the Transvaal's schools were in or below Standard I, and there were fewer than 50 children in or above Standard VI<sup>24</sup>. On top of these

---

23. According to Prof. J.D. Sadie of the University of Stellenbosch (Die Afrikaner in die landseksonomie, S.A.U.K., p. 33) the ratio of the average per-capita income of the Afrikaners to the average per-capita income of other Whites was 10:23 as late as 1946.

It was improving rapidly; at the time he wrote (about 1956) it was 10:17.

24. Prof. E.G. Pells, 300 Years of Education in South Africa, p. 54.



disadvantages had come, in the case of the republics, the devastation and general disruption of the Anglo-Boer War. And if immigration, largely for reasons which have been indicated, never attained massive proportions, the immigrants were usually people with sufficient capital, education or economic know-how to enable them to begin life in their new country a few rungs above the average Afrikaner on the economic ladder.

74. The juxtaposition of the comparatively well-to-do group and the comparatively depressed group, particularly in the circumstances of post-1901 South Africa, implied tensions and conflicts of interest, real and apparent, which required wise handling from both sides. When racial or linguistic divisions come to correspond closely with social and economic divisions, a potentially dangerous political situation is created. Racial sentiment is liable to be reinforced by the insecurity of the privileged and by the resentments and frustrations of the underprivileged.

75. The position of the English group was far from as secure as it seemed. The Afrikaners formed the majority of the White population and their birthrate was so much higher than the English rate as to outweigh the effect of any increase in the English group from immigration. Their history and their economic and social condition were such as to make a nationalist movement almost inevitable. They were a linguistically separate





group, a separate 'nation'. They had the additional bond of religious unity. They were, it could be maintained, the original White pioneers and settlers who had 'opened up the country to civilisation'. It was 'their' country. Despite a brave and sustained resistance they had been overwhelmed by an imperialist power out to secure the wealth of 'their' mines. They were now 'hewers of wood and drawers of water' in their own country. They and their language were disregarded by arrogant 'foreigners'. Self-respect demanded a reassertion of unashamed separate identity. The election of Botha and Smuts bore witness to such reassertion in so far as it was compatible with practical co-operation with the former enemy. Hertzog's education laws were evidence of a determination to maintain separate identity and unambiguous equality whether the opponent liked it or not. Vengeful feelings and the ambitions of politicians could lead such a movement to attempt to 'win by the ballot box what had been lost on the battle-field' and to establish Afrikaner domination.

76. In 1910 much was working below the surface which would only reveal itself in course of time.



## III

The South Africa Act.      The Official Languages.

The Provincial Councils and Education.

Legislation about the two official languages in  
Schools.      Compulsory mother-tongue instruction  
versus parental option.

77. With all four colonies enjoying responsible government, the way was now open for the consideration of closer union in the common interest. After Lord Selborne had set out the advantages of such a union in an able Memorandum, representatives of the four colonies met in a National Convention to consider the matter, and, if agreement in principle were found, to draw up a draft constitution. In due course a draft was approved by the Convention, then approved by each colony, and finally confirmed by the Convention. The draft constitution so adopted was then passed by the British Parliament as the South Africa Act of 1909, and on 31st May, 1910, the Union of South Africa came into being. It was probably accepted by most White South Africans not only as a constitutional union but also as implying a 'union of hearts' between Dutch and English-speaking. After the honeymoon period, however, it became clear that the two parties had not interpreted all the clauses in the ante-nuptial contract in the same sense.





78. The Natal delegates to the Convention had favoured a federal constitution but had found little support for this idea. The constitution as finally approved was unitary, vesting all authority finally in the central government. In deference to federal feeling, a provincial council was to be set up in each of the colonies (after Union to be called 'provinces'), with certain powers, inter alia, in terms of Section 85(iii), the power to provide for:

'Education, other than higher education, for a period of five years and thereafter until Parliament otherwise provides.'

79. Even in its own field, however, a Provincial Council did not have the final word. Its Ordinances had to be approved by the Governor-General before becoming effective. And an Ordinance could not authorise any provision inconsistent with the terms of an Act of the Union Parliament.

80. Section 137 was one of two Sections deemed so important that they were specially entrenched and required a two-thirds majority of all members of Parliament for their amendment.

Section 137 reads:

'Both the English and Dutch languages shall be official languages of the Union, and shall be treated on a footing of equality, and possess and enjoy equal freedom, rights and privileges; all records, journals and proceedings of Parliament shall be kept in both languages, and all Bills, Acts, and notices of general public importance or interest issued by the Government of the Union shall be in both languages.'





81. It will be noted that this Section made it necessary for at least three of the Provincial Councils to examine existing legislation governing the teaching of English and Dutch in their schools. Only the Free State's legislation was fully consistent with the principle of equal treatment, and it was open to objection as making the teaching of both languages compulsory.

82. The language question was a major issue in the first post-Union election, and in November 1910 the Minister of Education, Mr. F.S. Malan, wrote to the four provincial Administrators asking them to examine the legislation in their Provinces with a view to establishing a) to what extent it was consistent with the principle of Section 137 of the Constitution, and b) how, if it were inconsistent with that Section, it might be amended. Later in the month he convened a conference of the heads of the four provincial education departments to consider the matter. In due course, the reports from the Provinces and the recommendations of the committee of heads of education departments were tabled in Parliament and the matter was debated vigorously and at length.

83. Briefly, the case put forward by members of the English-speaking Unionist Party was:

- a) that parents should be free to choose the language through the medium of which their children would be educated;



- b) that parents should have the right to require instruction in the second language for their children, but that learning of the second language should not be compulsory;
- c) that student teachers should not be compelled to learn the second language, or penalised because of their unilingualism.

84. The opposite point of view, as put forward most typically by General Beyers, was:

- a) that the medium of instruction in all cases should be the mother tongue; this was 'a fundamental educational principle.'
- b) that the learning of the second language should be obligatory, unless the parent lodged a written objection;
- c) that student teachers should be required to learn, and pass the prescribed examinations in, both languages.

85. In brief, the objections to the English proposals were that they would perpetuate the injury done to Dutch-speaking children at present compelled (by parents 'too stubborn' or 'too ignorant' to understand the 'fundamental educational principle') to learn through a 'foreign' medium rather than through the medium of the language best known to them, their mother-tongue. The much-vaunted freedom therefore amounted to:

- a) freedom for the Dutch parent to choose English as medium for his child's education (while no English parent would choose Dutch as medium for his child);
- b) freedom for the English child and student to remain unilingual without suffering disadvantage, leaving the full burden of bilingualism to be borne by the Dutch.





86. The objections to the opposing Dutch proposals were:

- a) that they were an infringement of the right of parents (or the local parent body) to choose the language in which their children would be educated, and so introduced a principle of compulsion not contained, or implied, in Section 137 or in the Constitution as a whole;
- b) that the proposed change from the existing school situation was not only unwanted by the majority of the parents whose legitimate wishes it would override, but was so far-reaching in its implications, e.g. for staffing the schools, as to be impracticable - the number of teachers qualified to teach in Dutch being quite inadequate to meet the demand which would be created by universal mother-tongue education;<sup>25</sup>
- c) that they would adversely affect the interests of a large number of serving teachers.

87. Sectional interests were obviously at stake on both sides. The status quo was agreeable to English cultural and educational interests. It assured the wider currency of English in the schools and, consequently, in public life. The proposed change, on the other hand, envisaged using the schools to bring about a revolutionary change in favour of Dutch in the cultural balance of power. It would remove Dutch children - against the wishes of very large numbers of their parents - from the educational influence of English

---

25. In 1915 there were 73,592 children in Standard IV and below in Cape Schools for Whites. Of these, 64 per cent has Dutch as home language. Parental choice had placed 43,377 of them in classes using only English as medium of instruction, 15,413 in classes using both English and Dutch, and 14,802 in classes using only Dutch. Compulsory mother-tongue legislation, if strictly enforced, would have placed 26,362 in classes using only English as medium, and 47,230 in classes using only Dutch. It had also clear implications for a similar transfer in the upper standards as the children moved up.



teachers and English-medium teaching and would place them in a Dutch educational environment under Dutch teachers teaching through the Dutch language, with clearly foreseeable, if long-term, implications for the currency of the two languages and the outlook of the children.

88. It would seem desirable to comment briefly here on the 'fundamental educational principle of mother-tongue education'. Obviously, if there is to be teaching at all, there must be communication between teacher and taught, which implies a language understood by both. In linguistically homogeneous civilised states the principle is taken for granted: the school language is automatically the common language of teacher and taught. Considered in isolation from other facts of the situation, and other things being equal, the principle would cause no debate. But in linguistically heterogeneous communities other things are not always equal. They were certainly not equal in South Africa in 1910. The majority of Afrikaners still considered Afrikaans unsuitable for school use, though the number and vigour of its champions was growing, as will be seen. The 'mother tongue', or 'home language' of the Afrikaans population was still officially deemed to be Dutch. And as between English and Dutch, at least some other things were even less equal. I translate the views of Dr. A.H. du Preez van Wyk<sup>26</sup>, until recently Director of Education in the Transvaal:

---

26. Die Invloed van die Engelse Skoolwese op die Kaapse Skoolwese, 1806-1915. Van Schaik, Pretoria, 1947, pp. 8-9.





'English was the official, the business and in some circles the social language, whereas Dutch (which, in spite of its closer relationship and similarity to Afrikaans, was also a foreign language) had no practical value except for religious purposes such as the reading of the Bible and the Catechism. The learning of Dutch was further inhibited by the fact that it no longer lived in the mouths of the people, while English was often heard and used as colloquial language. Langenhoven, who was particularly critical of Dutch, also alleged that, "the unusable, unlearnable Dutch, stone-dead in South Africa, was actually an advantage to English because, with its clumsy local impotence, it could not itself hold the field against English and only got in the way of the proper attack, which would succeed".<sup>27</sup>

89. The Afrikaners who chose the English medium for their children in these circumstances were not necessarily only the stubborn or the ignorant.

90. Following on the debate, Parliament referred the matter for further consideration to a Select Committee. The major recommendations of the Committee were that mother-tongue education (Dutch, in the case of the Afrikaans-speaking) should be compulsory up to Standard IV (the sixth school year) and that learning of the second language should be optional<sup>28</sup>. After further debate, the Report of the Select Committee was accepted and referred to the Provincial Administrations for their sympathetic consideration.

91. In the Transvaal, where the pre-Union Smuts legislation had prepared the way, an amending Ordinance brought that legislation into line with the recommendations of the

---

27. Quoted by van Wyk from Langenhoven, C.J., U Dienswillige Dienaar, p. 148.

28. Celliers, op. cit., p. 183.





Parliamentary Select Committee as from the beginning of 1912. In the Free State, English opposition to compulsory double-medium instruction above Standard IV was met by a new provision to the effect that 'the parent of any pupil shall have the right to claim that the second language shall be gradually introduced, and thereafter gradually used as a second medium in accordance with the intelligence of the pupil, and in such case provision shall be made for such pupil accordingly.' The provision envisaged, where parental choices required it, was the creation of parallel classes, and there had to be a teacher qualified to give instruction in the language of any minority of 15 or more pupils. After this Ordinance was passed, the private Council Schools were discontinued. In Natal, Ordinance No. 13 of 1916 provided for education through the medium of the parent's choice, and for the teaching of the second language at the parent's request. Before the end of that year, some hundreds of children had been transferred to Dutch-medium classes, and the movement gradually spread. Special steps, including some recruiting of teachers from Holland, were taken to meet the demand for Dutch-medium instruction. The voluntary principle of course made for a more gradual transition than the compulsory. Some little country schools switched to the Dutch medium. In the northern towns the needs of both language groups were met by parallel classes.



92. It was in the Cape Province that 'equal treatment', interpreted as implying compulsory instruction through the medium of the mother-tongue, was most difficult to enforce. The Provincial Council prescribed such instruction up to Standard IV by Ordinance No. 11 of 1912, and provided for a transitional period of three years to facilitate a smooth passage from the old system to the new.

93. At the end of this period, a Commission was set up, following on a request from Langenhoven, then a member of the Provincial Council. The Commission was to inquire to what extent the prescriptions of Ordinance No. 11 of 1912 had been carried out, and what could be done to assure that they were carried out in full.

94. The Commission found that most of the local school boards had not made very much progress. While 95 per cent of the English-speaking children were being taught exclusively or mainly in English, only 31 per cent of Dutch-speaking children were being so taught in Dutch. Of the remainder, 39 per cent were being taught in English, and 30 per cent through the medium of both languages in varying proportions. True, 46 per cent of the Dutch children in Sub-standard A (the beginners' class) were being taught in Dutch, as compared with only 15 per cent in Standard IV, so that further progress might be recorded as the juniors moved up the school. But the probability existed that as the juniors moved up they might change their medium,





in whole or in part, as had been the custom; and, in any case, 46 per cent was an unsatisfactory figure for the beginners' class three years after the introduction of the compulsory principle.

95. According to the report of the Commission a number of factors had contributed to produce this state of affairs. The Education Department had not given the definite and vigorous lead which the Provincial Council had the right to expect. Many senior officials regarded Dutch, at best, as a necessary evil. Others regarded it as a nuisance. The inspectorate was also blamed, and the Commission recommended that an instruction be sent to inspectors directing them that, as officials of the State, they should see to it that the laws of the State, in so far as they concerned their sphere of activity, were carried out, and directing them further to give all assistance in their power to school boards, school committees and teachers to the same end. The teachers had also failed. Some had been out of sympathy with the principles of the Ordinance. Others would have been prepared to carry it out, but their English training made it difficult for them to use Dutch as medium with confidence and they had continued to do their work as they felt they could best do it. The local boards and committees, with notable exceptions, had approached the matter half-heartedly and had not taken the necessary steps to provide the extra accommodation required for parallel classes, or the teachers



qualified to teach through the medium of Dutch. And the parents had also been half-hearted, ill-informed or misguided.

96. The Commission recommended<sup>29</sup> the obvious correctives: the appointment of bilingual inspectors, the training of bilingual teachers, the recruitment of teachers from Holland for the training colleges and the appointment of travelling officers to give information and guidance to local boards, teachers and parents.

97. Langenhoven was not prepared to endorse these recommendations but expressed a radically different point of view in a minority report. He considered that the weakness lay in the Ordinance itself - its object being the perpetuation of an artificially nurtured Dutch as medium of instruction in South Africa - and he expressed his conviction that the recognition of Afrikaans for educational purposes as de jure (as it was de facto) the language of the majority section of the White population was the key to the solution of the questions which the Commission had been appointed to investigate.

98. Writing later<sup>30</sup>, Langenhoven said of the majority report:

'It was a thorough and searching study, with every fact and conclusion supported by figures and other evidence, and such a terrible revelation of general downright disobedience of the law that there is nothing like it in our history.

---

29. Translated from van Wyk, op. cit., p. 172.

30. U Dienswillige Dienaar, pp. 235-6, translated.





'But all that the Report's condemnation amounted to was a condemnation of the Ordinance itself. Such a law could never be carried out; and if penal measures had been applied to compel obedience, the public, Dutch as well as English-speaking, would have become so rebellious as to compel the Provincial Council to rescind the Ordinance. Department and parents and teachers were blamed for having been unsympathetic to the law; where they were obedient, it was a sullen obedience. It was simply impossible to inspire the people or its servants (and I refer to the Dutch-speaking part of the people) with pleasure in or love for such a crazy undertaking as the use of High Dutch as medium of instruction in our schools. English schools carried on with English and with love-inspired devotion to their work. Afrikaans schools also, in so far as it was possible for them, carried on in English. For them there was no choice which could claim their devotion; they could only choose the easier of two artificial media, the one which was also the more profitable choice materially.'

99. In the next section, the gradual transition from Dutch to Afrikaans will be considered.





The Transition from Dutch to Afrikaans in the  
Schools. Definitive recognition of  
Afrikaans (1925)

100. Reference has been made to the establishment of the Genootskap van Regte Afrikaners in 1875 and to their work for the advancement of Afrikaans. While the movement grew, it remained a minority movement until well into the new century. The whole Dutch cultural establishment in South Africa was against it. Only the stately language of the Bible (in the Statenvertaling of the seventeenth century), only the cultivated language of the Netherlands, with its rich general and scientific literature, its text-books on philosophy, theology, law, fine arts, etc., could hold the field against English. Or so it was argued.<sup>31</sup>

101. It ought to have been clear by the turn of the century that Dutch was not holding the field. The Dutch book language of the schools meant less to the average Afrikaner than the English which he heard all round him. The speech of the poorer Afrikaners, especially in the Transvaal cities, said Gustav Preller, editor of De Volkstem, in 1905, was becoming a horrible mixture ('n aaklige mengelmoes). A large part of them were gradually degenerating to the level of an ignorant proletariat.<sup>32</sup>

---

31. See Pienaar, E.C., Taal en Poësie van die Tweede Afrikaanse Taalbeweging, Cape Town, 1920, p. 59.

32. Quoted by Pienaar, op. cit., p. 33.



They could be reached, and saved, through their own language, or not at all. And Preller pleaded his cause in a vigorous Afrikaans prose which demonstrated clearly enough some of the potential of Afrikaans when used by a cultivated and practised writer. Eugene Marais had already shown its fitness for poetry, when used by a poet.

102. The trouble was still that most educated Afrikaners were not prepared to write Afrikaans. Leaders of Church and school thundered against it.<sup>33</sup> 'The Church', declared the famous Dr. Bosman, 'will never be able to accept Afrikaans.' 'The kitchen language which is glorified in Pretoria', wrote Prof. Marais in the church journal De Gereformeerde Maandblad, 'is not the language of the educated Afrikaner'; and he pleaded for 'no patois, but pure Dutch.' Die Unie, organ of the Dutch teachers' union in the Cape, applauded in November, 1905, an attack on Preller's 'reckless radicalism' by its northern contemporary Het Kristelik Schoolblad. To break with Dutch, the Schoolblad had argued, would be suicidal, for Afrikaans had still to show that it could be the medium of elevated thought. And the Schoolblad was quite convinced of its unfitness for writing in elevated style (hogere stijl).

103. In the Cape Langenhoven had become the most eloquent champion of Afrikaans. He described the situation in the following terms in 1911.<sup>34</sup> 'How long must we remain in doubt?

---

33. See Pienaar, op. cit., pp. 33-34.

34. Ons Land, 15 Aug., 1911. Translated.





If Dutch is our language, why do we not speak it? If Afrikaans is our language, why do we not write it? Is the one too high for speech and the other too low for writing?... And so we stand... the only nation on earth which asserts the lawful claims of its mother tongue while it does not know what its mother tongue is.'

104. Gradually, a number of ideas favourable to Afrikaans gained wider currency. Afrikaans, as used in the kitchen, might be a 'kitchen language' but even that depended on who was in the kitchen; Afrikaans as used by competent speakers and writers could be direct, vigorous, sensitive, cultivated. Dutch was too 'bookish', too 'foreign'; to the non-scholastic Afrikaner its grammar was an irrelevancy for ever in the way of direct communication; Dutch could never be more than a minority language with a limited field of currency in South Africa. Further, it did not make sense to say that one must delay the recognition or use of Afrikaans until it was a 'kultuurtaal' with a fully developed scientific vocabulary and equipped with all the apparatus of learning. Only as people set about using it in more and more fields could it expand its range. Only as people felt the practical need of textbooks and journals would the need be met. One had to start somewhere and sometime. And one did not have to start from rock bottom. For concepts not current in the Boeretaal, there was the Dutch vocabulary as a ready supplement in the background. As far as vocabulary was concerned, Afrikaans was 'Afrikaans plus Dutch'.



105. The work of conversion had proceeded so far that on 25 April, 1914, Langenhoven felt able to move a resolution in the Cape Provincial Council a) expressing the Council's appreciation<sup>35</sup> of the increasing application by the education department of the sound principle of education through the medium of the mother tongue, as prescribed in the education ordinance; and b) recommending further that the Afrikaans form of Dutch (Afrikaans-Hollands) should be used up to Standard IV in all those classes where Dutch, according to law, was the medium to be used. Anticipating objection, the resolution went on to provide two safeguards: i) Provisionally, no readers written in Afrikaans were to be used unless they had been formally approved by a qualified person nominated by the Superintendent of Education or by the Z.A. Akademie voor Taal, Letteren en Kunst<sup>36</sup>; and ii) no such readers would be used in any school if the school committee concerned objected to their use.

106. The resolution was passed - unanimously. It was followed up at once by similar, though not identical, resolutions passed unanimously in the Orange Free State Provincial Council on 15th June of the same year, and in the Transvaal Provincial Council on 24th June. In all cases the English-speaking members of the Councils had voted with the Afrikaans-speaking.

---

35. A diplomatic approach. But see paragraphs 94-98 above.

36. The Akademie had been founded in 1909 to maintain and propagate the Dutch language and literature and also South African History, Antiquities and Art. Under 'Dutch' it included 'both forms of the language current in South Africa.' An early service to Afrikaans was the official spelling rules and list of 1915.





107. These resolutions were not favourably received by the Afrikaans teachers' societies, which still favoured Dutch. But the leaven was working and by the end of 1917 all of them had pledged their support to the use of Afrikaans. The support was soon to become enthusiastic.

108. For a language which had so long enjoyed the loyalty of the church, school and university, Dutch, as medium, disappeared from the classroom with remarkable speed. As a medium of communication between Afrikaans-speaking teachers and Afrikaans-speaking children, Afrikaans was more natural and more direct. There was at first much difficulty in finding the necessary readers, and textbooks generally, but that difficulty was gradually overcome. The following figures show that by 1924 Dutch had been almost completely replaced.

Medium in Cape Schools, 1924

Medium	Primary Schools	Secondary Schools
English	32,269	5,066
Afrikaans	26,241	386
Dutch	82	0
English and Afrikaans	59,550	9,087
English and Dutch	501	122

109. The Dutch Reformed Churches were also reconsidering their





<sup>37</sup>  
 hostile attitude to Afrikaans. Concerned with the propagation of religion in the tradition inherited from the Netherlands, the church had been a stronghold of the traditional church language. The Bible message itself had seemed almost inseparable from the language of the inherited Bible. But this citadel was also to yield to the popular tongue. The Gereformeerde Kerk had agreed in principle, as early as 1914, that the Bible should be translated into Afrikaans, and some of the ministers of this church began to use Afrikaans in the pulpit. In 1916 the Orange Free State synod accepted Afrikaans as well as Dutch as an official language of the church and agreed to the translation of the Bible into Afrikaans. It also appointed a committee to collaborate with the other Reformed churches in finding the best qualified translators. Similar resolutions were taken immediately afterwards by the largest Transvaal church. In 1919, first, the Natal synod and, second, the Cape synod accepted Afrikaans. In 1922 a translation of the Four Gospels and the Psalms was<sup>38</sup> issued, but did not make a very favourable impression .

---

37. 'One of the tragedies in the history of the Afrikaner people was the fact that its Church and its language were for so many years on a footing of hostility. Even those...who have hardly yet reached middle age can remember with what contempt some of our highest church leaders spoke of Afrikaans. It was condemned from pulpits and in writings as a mongrel and kitchen language not good enough to express the highest and noblest...'. Editorial in Die Huisgenoot, October 1944, welcoming the Afrikaans Hymnal. Translated.

38. A revised translation of these books issued in 1929 was generally very well received and in May 1933 the complete Bible in Afrikaans was formally taken into use. The rhymed Psalms appeared in 1937 and the Hymnal in 1944. See Nienaber, G.S. and P.J., Die Opkoms van Afrikaans as Kultuurtaal, Pretoria, 1949, pp. 79-84.



110. While Afrikaans became established more and more in the schools, controversy continued about the respective merits of the principle of compulsory mother-tongue education and the principle of parental choice of the language to be used as medium. There was also a recurring demand from synodal meetings of the Dutch Reformed Church and from educational conferences sponsored by the church for separate schools for Dutch (i.e. Afrikaans) children in which all education would be inspired by a Christian-National spirit.

111. The National Party, founded in 1915 under the leadership of General Hertzog, early declared itself in favour, in the educational field, of the maintenance of the separate cultural traditions of each of the White sections of the population, in contrast to the 'one-stream' policy of the Government, 'so that there might be a rich diversity instead of the dull uniformity of one official system.' The Party also favoured Free Christian-National Schools supported by state grants, compulsory mother-tongue education, emphasis on South African history, bilingualism for all teachers and the recognition of Afrikaans as official language in education.

112. At its congress in 1920, the S.A.O.U. had called for the extension of the compulsory mother-tongue principle to include children in all classes up to, and including, Standard VI (the eighth school year), instead of only up to Standard IV, and had also expressed its preference for separate schools for Afrikaans-speaking and English-speaking children. In this action, it was





endorsing the findings of a Dutch Reformed Church educational congress held at Middelburg in the same year where the following points of view, inter alia, had been put forward:

- 1) The emphasis in education should be on religion, moral character and national, i.e. Afrikaans, sentiment (volksgevoel).
- 2) It is educationally unsound to educate one people like another; therefore 'there should be separate schools in South Africa for Afrikaans and English-speaking children, and these schools should be controlled by separate school commissions.'
- 3) There should be compulsory mother-tongue education not only to Standard IV but right through to the university.
- 4) The teachers should be specially trained for the separate schools and classes. 'Separate training colleges for teachers are thus an absolutely essential requirement.'

113. After some argument in De Unie (organ of the S.A.O.U.) and The Educational News of S.A. (organ of the S.A.T.A.), the S.A.T.A. (South African Teachers' Association) expressed its official policy at its 1921 congress in a statement<sup>39</sup> of which the following points are the most important:

1. There are three principles which should determine the medium through which instruction to children is given:

- a) No young child ought to receive instruction through a medium unfamiliar to it, except as specified in b), since such unfamiliarity gratuitously hinders the child's progress, especially in the early stages.

---

39. See Celliers, op. cit., pp. 244-5.



b) In teaching a language as a subject, that language as far as possible be used as a medium, at first in conjunction with the more familiar language, and afterwards alone.

c) The parents' wishes as regards the medium should be respected unless completely at variance with these first two principles.

From these principles it follows:-

(i) That the best medium is the home-language, where 'home language shall be taken to mean the language best known and understood by the pupil' (Consolidating Ordinance, 1921).

(ii) That the substitution of Afrikaans for Nederlands is to be welcomed.

(iii) That in the lower classes the greater stress should be laid on a), children up to and including Standard IV being as a rule placed in the class using their home language as medium.

(iv) That in the higher classes the greater stress should be laid on c), and that therefore parents should as a rule be allowed, in Standards V to X, to place their children in the school or class using the medium they prefer.

(v) That in places where there are children of two different home-languages it is desirable to have parallel classes throughout the ten standards, either in the same school or in different schools, so that the use of the home-language as medium and the parents' right of choice may always be realities. (In this connection the S.A.T.A. thinks it desirable that Afrikaans and English-speaking children should join freely in common school activities, but nevertheless would prefer separate medium schools to any system that might give rise to a feeling that





educational rights were being withheld, or parental freedom curtailed).

114. At a joint council meeting the S.A.O.U. members were unable to accept points 1(c), (iii) and (iv) of the S.A.T.A. policy statement. And the S.A.O.U. in November 1921 reaffirmed its faith in the following statement:

1. A child can derive proper benefit from his education only if he receives it through his mother tongue.

2. In order to secure the effective application of the principle of mother-tongue medium, the S.A.O.U. favours separate schools for English and Afrikaans-speaking children where this is at all possible.

3. Where separate schools for valid reasons are not possible, parallel classes must be set up.

4. Where it is absolutely essential to use a foreign medium in education this should in no case be done before Standard VII.

115. The medium question was again discussed at an S.A.O.U. meeting at Kirstenbosch in 1925 when the policy as set out above was reaffirmed. A minority group led by Dr. E.G. Malherbe had pleaded for double-medium education in the interests of national (e.g. Dutch and English) unity.

116. The law was already on the side of the S.A.O.U. on the principle of compulsory mother-tongue medium. In 1925 an amending Ordinance extended the compulsion to include Standard VI.





117. The definitive recognition of Afrikaans came in 1925. In 1924 the National Party, together with the smaller Labour Party, had won the general election, and an essentially Nationalist Government, with General Hertzog as Prime Minister but including two Labour ministers, assumed power. In 1925 a joint committee of both Houses of Parliament was set up to consider whether... the Afrikaans form of the Dutch language should be used in place of the Netherlands form of Dutch in respect of Bills and Acts of Parliament, and also of official documents of both Houses. The Committee recommended that Afrikaans should be included under Dutch, with retrospective effect from the date of Union, that Afrikaans should be the form used in future, and that the Government, by the provision of a state grant, should undertake the compilation of a standard Afrikaans dictionary which was a requirement for official as well as educational and general purposes. Following on the adoption by Parliament of the committee's report, Parliament enacted (Act No. 8 of 1925) as follows:

'The word "Dutch" in section one hundred and thirty-seven of the South Africa Act, 1909, and wheresoever else that word occurs in the said Act, is hereby declared to include Afrikaans.'

After this Act, Bills and Acts of Parliament soon began to be drafted in Afrikaans, and Afrikaans rapidly displaced Dutch from its remaining strongholds in South Africa.

118. As section 137 was one of the two entrenched clauses of the South Africa Act, it required, for acceptance, a two-thirds majority of both Houses of Parliament, sitting in a joint session.



It may be fitting to end this section with a quotation from Senator Langenhoven's speech on that occasion:

'Throughout the world the respect that is felt for a people is felt for the way in which that people expresses the highest that is in it... . Therefore, if the language of the people is kept away from the highest functions of State, that leads not only to the derogation of the esteem which others feel for that people, but it is hurtful to the self-respect of the people themselves. That is why the purpose for which we have gathered is of so much importance, not only to the Dutch-speaking people, but of so much importance to the welfare of the country itself. Here I must associate myself very heartily with every word that has fallen so eloquently from the Minister. Under the conditions imposed upon us for altering our constitution we alone were not enough. We require a two-thirds majority, and therefore we require the good will of the English-speaking section of South Africa. Here they are whole-heartedly giving us that support and help without which this injury to our self-respect could not have been remedied. We have had our bitternesses in the past, and I have no doubt we shall have our differences in the future; but what the English-speaking section have done here in a matter that - so far as sentiment is concerned - is nearest and dearest to our hearts, is a thing we shall not lightly forget.'





## V

English and Afrikaans in the schools 1925 - 1939Urbanisation. Single-medium, dual-medium and  
parallel-medium schools

119. After the Anglo-Boer War and, more particularly, after the First World War there had been some drift of White population from the country to the towns - a normal development in countries passing from a predominantly agricultural to a predominantly industrial order of society. But the transition was complicated by special features in South Africa. While numbers of young country people of fair education, English and Afrikaner, came to live in the towns for professional training, and remained there, and while others joined the services or found employment in private enterprise, probably the majority of the new townsmen from the South African countryside in these years were people who had made the move because they were no longer able to make a living in the areas where they had been born. Many of them were of the poor White<sup>40</sup> class, and most of these, particularly the older men, had had only a very brief period of schooling. They could not obtain skilled employment or clerical work in the town because of their lack of education and of vocational training. They did not fit into the ranks of unskilled

---

40. Estimated by the Poor White Commission to number 300,000.



labour - as such people would do in countries of radically homogeneous population - because in South Africa unskilled labour was traditionally not work for White men - it was 'kaffir work'. Too often they simply exchanged rural poverty for the squalor of an urban slum. Too often, for White South Africa's peace of mind, they lived cheek by jowl, on a basis of economic equality, with the poor of other races. Their way of life was a reproach to the more comfortably placed.

120. To begin with, South Africa did not know how to deal with the problem. It was realised that these people did not easily adjust themselves to town life. The obvious solution, therefore, seemed to be to make it possible for them to go back to the land. The State developed schemes of agricultural training and settled numbers on government farms. The Dutch Reformed Church established an irrigation settlement on the banks of the Orange River at Kakamas. But such efforts were merely palliatives. They could not deal with the rising numbers of a rural population with a high birthrate, perhaps a third of whose members were in danger of being 'submerged'.

121. One way out of the impasse was found by General Hertzog's first government which came to power in 1924. The concept of 'civilised labour' was evolved, and 'uncivilised labour' was to be replaced as far as possible





by 'civilised'. The first paragraph of a circular<sup>41</sup> from the Prime Minister to the heads of all Government Departments explains the scheme clearly enough for present purposes:

'(i) The Prime Minister desires it to be understood by all Departments of State that it has been decided as a matter of definite policy that, wherever practicable, civilized labour shall be substituted in all employment by the Government for that which may be classified as uncivilized. Civilized labour is to be considered as the labour rendered by persons, whose standard of living conforms to the standard generally recognized as tolerable from the usual European standpoint. Uncivilized labour is to be regarded as the labour rendered by persons whose aim is restricted to the bare requirements of the necessities of life as understood among barbarous and undeveloped peoples'.

A Department of Labour was set up with the task of establishing areas of employment in which poor Whites would be protected against non-White competition and paid 'civilised' rates of pay. Contractors on government construction jobs were subsidised to make it possible for them to employ White labour at 'civilised' rates. Municipalities and other authorities were encouraged to employ more Europeans on a similar basis. Government Departments employed them where they were employable in their service. The State railway system provided a major field for the experiment. Between 1921 and 1928 the number of White unskilled railway workers rose from 4,705 to 15,878, and it was to continue

---

41. Prime Minister's Circular No. 5 of Oct. 31, 1924. See Official Year Book of the Union of S.A., 1926-1927, p.203





its steep rise. The schools arranged special evening classes at railway centres to enable these workers to continue their education to Standard VI, after which they could qualify for advancement to 'graded' posts with prospects of further advancement in the railway service. Subsidised housing made it possible for them to live in a 'civilised' environment. 'The success of the policy of higher wages and protected labour for the poor Whites', writes de Kiewiet<sup>42</sup>, 'was not small. The conviction that hard manual labour was incompatible with a white skin grew weaker. Thousands of men once deemed 'irreclaimable' were elevated to a level of greater self-respect. Many discovered new resources of initiative and advanced into the ranks of semi-skilled or even skilled labour. When economists declared that the higher wages were a form of bounty, and that protected labour was uneconomical, the answer was given that the sacrifice was well made if the unfortunate elements in the White population ultimately found an assured footing in modern life.'

122. A consideration of the implications of this policy for the non-White workers replaced would not be relevant in the present context.

---

42. De Kiewiet, C.W., A History of South Africa, Social and Economic, O.U.P. 1941, p. 224.



123. The work begun for the rehabilitation of the poor Whites by subsidised employment in 1924 was carried forward by the schools. Even where the parents remained in the ranks of unskilled labour, the children were given the general education and the opportunities for vocational training necessary for satisfactory placement and for their economic advancement generally. An Agricultural and Industrial Requirements Commission<sup>43</sup> made it clear that South Africa's natural resources, if limited in the agricultural field, held promise of enormous industrial development, and that large transfers of manpower from agriculture to other economic areas a) were taking place, and b) were desirable. The necessary capital for development was available from the gold mines. And industrial development was in fact so rapid that by the end of the Second World War the 'poor Whites', as a special class of near-unemployables, had disappeared.<sup>44</sup> There remain, inevitably, considerable numbers of feckless and inefficient Whites (the distribution of measurable abilities in the White population being normal) but a policy of equal educational opportunity (sometimes with the tag 'plus a little extra for the backward'), has seen to it that each generation, as far as public policy can provide, starts with a fair chance.

---

43. Third Interim Report, Government Printer, Pretoria, 1941.

44. So that in the end poor Whitism was eliminated not so much by ad hoc measures as by the education of the children and by their integration into the soaring economy of the '30s and '40s.





124. The influx of surplus rural population of all levels was to make the White population essentially an urban population. After dead-end experiments with 'school farms', school growth was to take place more and more in the urban areas. As the new townspeople were mainly Afrikaans-speaking, and existing schools in the larger towns were mainly English schools, growing provision for Afrikaans-medium education had to be made in the towns.

125. At first the provision was usually made by opening Afrikaans-medium classes at conveniently placed existing schools and by conducting those schools on parallel-medium principles, i.e. the English-speaking children received their instruction in English in their own classrooms and the Afrikaans-speaking theirs in different classrooms, both coming together for school assemblies and prayers, which were conducted on alternate mornings, or in alternate weeks in English and in Afrikaans. They also came together in the playground and played together in the same school teams for games and athletics. It was the traditional system of the South African countryside, both in Natal, where the English-speaking pupils were usually in the majority, and in the other provinces, where the majority was usually Afrikaans-speaking. It had much to commend it, particularly in the country where it brought the entire local community together. It gave children of both groups some experience at school of living and working in a common



society. It gave them some opportunity of hearing the 'other' language used in the ordinary business of life. It made for mutual acceptance as members of one group. It provided patterns of co-operation. It is still the pattern of the typical South African school - outside the larger urban areas - in which both language groups are represented.

126. It had, in the beginning, an additional practical advantage in the cities for the incoming Afrikaners. It provided home-language instruction within reasonable distance of home. When the present writer assumed duty as an inspector of schools in Durban in 1931, there were not enough children in Afrikaans-medium classes in the Durban area to fill one average-sized urban school. The small number lived mainly on the outskirts of the town, north at Greenwood Park, south on the Bluff and west at Pinetown, with another small group in the old borough of Durban. Each was many miles from the next. Their needs were conveniently met by the system of local parallel classes. This was an advantage which counted for less and less as the Afrikaans-speaking population grew to a size which justified the provision of several schools.



127. But the parallel-class system in the cities was not without its problems. Integration did not come automatically. If the principal was not sympathetic, a minority group could be made to feel that they did not belong. If they were a small minority, they could influence the general spirit of the school comparatively little and it remained a single-medium school with an appendix. If, as often happened, their average economic status was lower than that of the majority, they might feel that they were not a respected group. Other things being equal, the best integrative results were to be expected when the difference in socio-economic status was not too wide and when the minority group made up a substantial proportion of the total enrolment. Unfortunately, the distribution of the children of the two language groups in many areas did not make a balanced school population possible in the local school.

128. As the principals of parallel-medium schools had to be bilingual, unilingual teachers watched the opening of such schools with a jealous eye. Each large urban school converted to parallel classes meant the loss of a senior promotion post to the unilingual. In Natal, promotion posts for the unilingual were also closing down in certain formerly unilingual country towns where the arrival of civil servants and railworkers from other provinces brought





parallelism to the local school. As these country schools were run on the ladder of promotion to the higher posts in the cities, the unilingual gradually found their channels of promotion being very seriously narrowed. This was particularly hard on immigrant teachers and on older teachers who had completed their own schooling before Afrikaans was in use in the schools. But if it were conceded as it had to be, that both groups of children in a school were entitled to a head-master who understood what was going on in their classrooms, then the position had to be accepted. In 1930, one predominantly English teachers' society, the S.A.T.A. (Cape Province) held a series of discussions in its major urban centres on the respective merits of parallel classes and separate schools. A majority of the members at all centres favoured parallel classes.

129. English-speaking parents generally accepted parallel-medium schools as a good thing in theory, but it would be too much to say that they always showed great enthusiasm for them. Some preferred parallel-medium schools for their own children. Others preferred single-medium. Of most, it would probably be true to say that they accepted the locally convenient school, single-medium or parallel, if it was a reasonably efficient school.



130. By and large, the majority who were happy about the Coalition (see paragraph 137) Government accepted the principle of 'bringing the children together' as being essential to their co-operation later in the affairs of South Africa generally.

131. From earlier references, it will be recalled that there was a strong body of feeling on the organised Afrikaner front in favour of separate schools. This feeling was fortified during the period of urbanisation by the fear that the many new influences of urban life in mainly English-speaking cities might tend to anglicise the unsophisticated children from the country and weaken their attachment to church and community. The school was made a strong countervailing force. It became a special task of the school to assure that these newcomers to the cities should not be 'lost to their people' (verlore vir hulle volk). Compulsory mother-tongue medium and separate schools became, more than ever, articles of faith.

132. More and more Afrikaans-speaking children were in fact receiving their education through the medium of Afrikaans alone. There were several reasons. As the demand increased, more and better textbooks were produced in Afrikaans. More general reading matter became available. More teachers were trained in Afrikaans. Under the Hertzog Governments, Afrikaans was being used more and more in public life, and bilingualism was becoming essential for appointment and





promotion in government posts. So Afrikaans-speaking parents had less inducement to choose English as medium for their children. Those who continued to do so in spite of the home-language compulsion provisions - by the expedient of declaring their home language to be English - were stopped by legislation which placed on teachers the responsibility for deciding which language the child spoke best. By 1927, 91.4 per cent of Afrikaans-speaking children in the primary schools of the Cape Province were being instructed in Afrikaans.

133. The following figures show the steady tendencies a) away from English medium, b) away from dual medium and c) towards Afrikaans medium in the schools of all Provinces for the years 1932 - 1939. Apart from Natal, where the principle of parental option still prevails, practically only English-speaking children were to be found in English-medium classes, and the number of children using both languages as media was declining sharply. The figures are percentages.



	Primary Classes			Secondary Classes			All Classes		
	E.	A.	A+E.	E.	A.	A+E.	E.	A.	A+E.
<u>CAPE</u>									
1932	33.2	52.1	14.7	51.3	28.4	20.3	35.5	49.0	15.5
1939	31.2	60.7	8.1	36.9	46.3	16.8	32.2	58.2	9.6
<u>NATAL</u>									
1932	87.8	9.3	2.9	93.9	5.6	0.5	88.6	8.8	2.6
1939	84.7	14.8	0.5	88.2	9.5	2.3	85.2	14.0	0.8
<u>TRANSVAAL</u>									
1932	35.5	59.9	4.6	57.5	32.0	10.5	37.2	57.7	5.1
1939	33.3	65.3	1.4	40.2	58.2	1.6	34.2	64.4	1.4
<u>O.F.S.</u>									
1932	13.0	85.4	1.6	16.9	34.8	48.3	13.6	78.0	8.4
1939	10.7	89.2	0.1	15.4	76.4	8.2	11.6	86.8	1.6
<u>UNION</u>									
1932	35.6	56.1	8.3	51.2	28.2	20.6	37.4	52.9	9.7
1939	33.9	62.2	3.9	39.2	51.5	9.3	34.8	60.5	4.7

134. Such progress of Afrikaans in the educational world and in the public life of South Africa went far to satisfy General Hertzog that his ideal of equal treatment for the two languages was in process of being realised. He had also been pleased by the resolutions of the Imperial Conferences of 1926 and 1930 which led to the Statute of Westminster and the independence of the Dominions. He had no further demands to make on behalf of the Afrikaans people. Their just claims, he felt, had been met. There now remained 'no reason whatever



why, in the field of politics and statecraft, Afrikaans and English South Africans should not feel and act in the spirit of a consolidated South African nation.' <sup>45</sup>

135. Conciliatory talk like this was offensive to the politically irreconcilable Afrikaners organised in the powerful secret society, the Broederbond ('band of brothers'), which had as its object an Afrikaner-dominated republic outside the Commonwealth. They had not been satisfied with the speed of Afrikanerisation of the services or of education during the Premiership of General Hertzog, and set up a public cultural arm, the Federasie van Afrikaanse Kultuurvereniginge ('Federation of Afrikaans Cultural Societies'), usually referred to by its initials as the F.A.K., to force the pace. The F.A.K. was ostensibly a non-political, cultural organisation, linking Afrikaans educational and cultural organisations throughout the country for mutual support. In practice it was a public face for the Broederbond and provided Broederbond leaders with a 'non-political' public platform which they used to divert the cultural activities of Afrikaans-speaking people into sectionalist channels. As an indication of its tone, I quote from its Silver Jubilee (Silwerjubileum) souvenir booklet issued in 1954 a description of its first congress:

---

45. Quoted in J. Cope, South Africa, Benn, London, 1965, p. 112.





'For the first time in its history the cultural fighters of the Afrikaans people (volk) assembled in a Volk's Congress on 18th and 19th December, 1929. Cultural need had necessitated mobilisation. Within the camp, the enemy of the volk was called by his name, the field of battle was marked out, friends of the volk were bound together, and battle tactics were planned in detail by every cultural fighter.'

136. This warlike preparation against an enemy whose name could best be spoken 'within the camp' suggests a gallant F.A.K. stand against an alien oppressor. In fact, it took place in the sixth year of General Hertzog's Prime Ministership, under a Nationalist Government in which the Minister of Education was Dr. Malan, when any reasonable plans for the advancement of Afrikaans would have enjoyed cordial official sympathy.

137. Political developments were soon to bring the Broederbond and all its subsidiaries into direct opposition with General Hertzog. During an economic depression, Britain departed from the gold standard in September 1931. General Hertzog's Government decided that the South African pound should maintain its old value in terms of gold. It was a decision with unfortunate consequences. It depressed, in terms of South African currency, the prices received by farmers for produce sold in England, South Africa's main export market. Great quantities of low-grade ore in the gold mines remained out of reach of economic exploitation while the old gold price was maintained. A long controversy ended in a political crisis and, with the country in severe



financial difficulties, South Africa brought its pound to parity with sterling in December, 1932. Early in the new year a coalition government was formed in which General Hertzog was Prime Minister and General Smuts, leader of the former Opposition, was Deputy Prime Minister.

138. This coming together of the two large parliamentary parties was welcomed by most South Africans of both language groups, though the separatist Nationalists disliked the idea of a coalition which must at least slow down the advancement of their ideals, and many English-speaking people distrusted a government headed by General Hertzog. A general election blessed the union by returning 138 Coalitionists to a House of 150 members. Two Natal Home Rulers were among the Opposition, but the reluctant wing of the Nationalists went along with the majority until after the elections. The following year saw their withdrawal from the coalition and their establishment of the 'purified' National Party under the leadership of Dr. D.F. Malan which, with Broederbond help in the background, succeeded in capturing control of most of the old National Party's political assets in the Cape (including the major Afrikaans newspaper, Die Burger) and in capturing much of the organisation in the Free State and Transvaal as well.<sup>46</sup>

---

46. See Cope, J., op. cit., p. 112.





General Hertzog's Nationalists and General Smuts's S.A.P. 'fused', creating the United National South African Party (now the United Party).

139. With most South Africans in favour of the political 'fusion' which had taken place, the F.A.K. made it its business to oppose any manifestations of the fusionist spirit which appeared in the ranks of its affiliated societies. Celliers, for example, reports:<sup>47</sup>

Fusion in the political field also found an echo at the 1937 congress of the S.A.O.U. where the following 'unity' proposal was put forward:

'The S.A.O.U. requested the Department of Education to establish in built-up areas, where possible, schools with English-medium and Afrikaans-medium classes in the same building so that pupils may the more readily become bilingual by contact with other pupils who speak the other official language.'

After a long discussion the proposal was dropped and the following businesslike resolution adopted 'standing and with enthusiasm':

'The S.A.O.U. believes in the education of the volk through the language of the volk - i.e. in a faithful, undiluted mother-tongue-medium education as the sole faith of educational salvation (die enigste opvoedkundige, saligmakende geloof).

140. What made the F.A.K. a particularly insidious threat to national unity was the fact that it combined genuine and valuable cultural work with its divisive propaganda.

---

47. Op. cit., p. 251.



As an example of genuine cultural work mention may be made of a series of English-Afrikaans word-lists designed to encourage the use of purer Afrikaans by making Afrikaans equivalents available for English terms which often larded the speech of non-academic Afrikaners. In 1937<sup>48</sup> these lists covered the following fields: motoring, groceries and butchery, everyday words, rugby and soccer, cricket, target shooting, water-polo and tennis, billiards and golf, hockey and basket-ball, aviation, cookery and shoemaking. Others were in preparation. The 1937 report also records other legitimate cultural activities, such as a deputation to the Minister of Justice to put the case for the wider use of Afrikaans in the courts of law (it appeared that in fact the Department had been acting with proper regard for both languages); or a deputation to the Minister of Education to urge the case for an Afrikaans Faculty of Medicine (the deputation had been sympathetically received); or the representations to the S.A. Broadcasting Corporation for a larger share for Afrikaans in the broadcast programmes (though it is interesting that here - at a time when the great majority of licensed listeners were English-speaking the F.A.K. requested 'a bilingual service, on a basis of absolute equality and not parallel' and 'all announcements, including those of musical items, to be made in the two languages alternately').

---

48. Referate en Verslag F.A.K. Kongres, 6 & 7 Julie 1937, p. 107.



141. People impressed by genuine cultural work of this kind could the more easily be misled by the F.A.K.'s racist rhetoric in the same report about a 'Jewish-imperialist policy' alleged to be using 'our' natural resources against Afrikanerdom, about Jewish immigration (die instroming van ongewenste elemente), about the Boer war as essentially a war against defenceless women and children, about miscegenation, and Native, Coloured and 'Coolie'; or by F.A.K. plans for dividing the trades-union movement, and indeed the whole economy, on racial lines.

142. A paper on 'Threatening Cultural Dangers', read at the Congress and printed with the Report<sup>49</sup> is mentioned here for two reasons: first, its references to the need for an Afrikaans medical school reflect the spirit in which new advances were too often demanded, and later received; and second, for some seminal suggestions made in it for the use of Afrikaans in African education.

143. It will be clear that the absence of an Afrikaans Medical Faculty in 1937 was not due to an unsympathetic Government. If the establishment of such a Faculty had been a simple matter, it would, presumably, have been provided by the earlier Nationalist Governments. They had not provided it. Now the request had been made to General Hertzog's

---

49. Ibid., pp. 72-87.





Coalition Government, which had received it sympathetically. But as the request had now been made to a Government to which the F.A.K. was hostile, the matter could be presented aggressively as a demand for a right deliberately withheld, and the benefit, when in due course received, could be represented as a victory gained by the whipped-up agitation. I quote, in translation, from the paper:

'And now I come to the next fortress which we must capture. So many of our Afrikaner youths, after a brilliant school career, are faced at the university with the great question - What now? If he chooses medicine or engineering he finds that he has to make an intellectual somersault, for now everything must be in English. His whole Afrikaner spirit, sentiment and intelligence must give way - he must live in an English atmosphere if he wants to be a medical doctor. I have the greatest admiration for the fathers who almost ruin themselves economically in order to send their sons to Holland or Germany rather than to see violence done to their souls in their own country. And it is so unjust - I know that it costs a lot of money to maintain a medical faculty, but it is our money. As taxpayers we have at least the right to demand that our language should get its rights. Even if the young Afrikaner qualifies as a doctor, we are faced with the danger, particularly, that his national (volks) and cultural sentiment will have suffered an injury which will be fatal for those of us who count on his help in the cultural fight because his profession makes him a man of status and influence. And we are not going to be satisfied with an apologetic little Faculty - we want the best the country offers. And if we are in earnest about it, I envisage, in foreseeable time, a complete medical and engineering school where the Afrikaner can be instructed in his own language. The ministerial reply to a deputation was sympathetic; but sympathy is not enough. We must keep on asking and pointing out the necessity until sympathy becomes an act. Every Afrikaans-speaking doctor and engineer must support us - if they do so with all their strength the victory will be ours.'



144. The following excerpts<sup>50</sup> on African education also have their relevance to the bicultural situation:

'At the risk of being considered a negrophilist, I should like to make some remarks about our attitude towards the coloured races of South Africa. We have to do with some millions of natives who are gradually, whether we like it or not, receiving more and more education... And where does the educated native range himself? It does not help to say with a gesture of distaste that we do not want him with us - that is by no means the plan. But we also do not want him against us - for then the counter-current would become irresistibly strong. We must see to it in the first place that the native learns Afrikaans - I know that our people ("die Boere") in the north who speak the language of the native would consider it the grossest insult if any kaffir were to address them in Afrikaans. I also know that there are many Afrikaners who speak the language of the native of their region. But there are not many Afrikaners who speak more than one kaffir dialect. And if we should have to speak with the kaffir in other regions what language is to be used? I believe that it should be Afrikaans. That gives us another seven million people, which will make our language the strongest and the preponderating one in this part of the world. Can we let such a force be lost to us because of a false notion of our self-esteem and national pride? And our inherited feelings about the attitude which we should adopt towards the kaffir lead us directly into this danger. If we do not wake up it will be too late. If every kaffir in South Africa spoke Afrikaans the economic power of Afrikaans would be so strong that we should no longer need an F.A.K. to watch over our cultural interests... The native will in future be a much bigger factor in the development of our country than is the case at present - and we must shape that factor so that it serves our purposes, assures our victory and perpetuates our language, our culture and volk...' \*

---

50. Ibid.

\* This policy, the speaker went on to say, had been followed with great success in the education of the Cape Coloured people.





Some maxims for delegates to remember came at the end of the paper, among others:

'Do not think that the kaffir who speaks Afrikaans is insulting your language. He can be our cultural servant as he is our farm servant.'

'Remember that you are in the first place an Afrikaner and that you owe your promotion to that.'

'Don't sit back complacently and think that the battle is won. As long as there are two cultural streams in this country we must keep our harness on our backs.'

145. In 1939, the F.A.K. set up its education institute, the Institute for Christian-National Education (I.C.N.O.) to propagate its Christian-National ideals for education and to work systematically for their practical realisation. More will be heard of the I.C.N.O. later. But attention must first be given to a comprehensive survey of the actual state of bilingualism in the Union in 1938, and to the results of extensive efforts to foster bilingualism and intersectional understanding by the partial use of the second language as medium of instruction.



The Bilingualism Survey of 1938

146. Dr. E.G. Malherbe, then Director of the National Bureau for Educational and Social Research, undertook an extensive survey of bilingualism in South African schools in 1938. The results of the survey were published in The Bilingual School: a Study of Bilingualism in South Africa <sup>51</sup>, of which book, now unfortunately out of print, this section summarises points relevant to our present theme.

147. In a preliminary chapter, Dr. Malherbe points out that bilingualism is not equilingualism and describes in some detail six stages of practical bilingualism, gauged chiefly by the subject's proficiency in his second language. In summary, they are as follows:

Stage I. The ability to follow intelligently an ordinary conversation, speech, or sermon in the second language, both in spoken and written form, and to read the newspapers in that language. These are considered the minimum requirements for citizenship in a bilingual country like South Africa where there is such a great interspersion of the two sections.

Stage II. The ability, further, to converse intelligently and with fair fluency in the second language. The accent may not be perfect nor the idiom altogether pure, but the speaker can make himself understood for practical purposes. The ability, further, to read books and magazines. Bilingualism of this stage should suffice for employment where both languages are spoken, e.g. in the work of shopkeepers, salesmen conductors.

---

51. C.N.A., Johannesburg, 1943.



Stage III. The foregoing, and also the ability to write the language correctly. The minimum for clerks or secretaries in the Government service who wish to be considered bilingual.

Stage IV. The foregoing. Further, a convincing power of expression, both in writing and in speaking both languages. Speech must be fluent, and accent and idiom fit to serve as models for children to imitate. This stage is regarded as the minimum requirement of the bilingual teacher. Such teachers are required particularly for smaller schools which cannot have full-time specialists for both languages on their staffs. (Test figures for final-year students in Transvaal Normal Colleges (Teachers' Colleges) are given which showed a deplorable shortcoming in this respect.)

Stage V. This is the stage reached by those who command a greater facility and power in both languages than 90 per cent of the people who use either language as mother tongue. Examples from South African public life are given.

Stage VI. The unapproachable ideal of 100 per cent perfection in both languages. Mentioned only for theoretical completeness.

148. It is pointed out, finally, that the stages overlap, and that none of them is reached by learning lists of words or mechanical rules. Ability in the second language, as in the first, comes only with years of actual usage. The second language should therefore not only be learned at school but also used in the school's activities.

149. In Chapter II some principles of language learning are discussed and there is a resumé of the position in respect of the two official languages in South African schools at the time. Briefly, in the Cape and Orange Free State Provinces up to Standard VI, and in the Transvaal up to Standard IV, all





children had to be educated through the medium of their home language, English or Afrikaans. Above these levels the parents might claim that the second language be used as medium, gradually or completely, but this right was being exercised in decreasing measure. In Natal, the parents had the right to choose the medium of their children's education at all stages and about 40 per cent of the children from Afrikaans-speaking homes were in English-medium classes. In all Provinces, practically all children learnt their second language - i.e. the one not used as medium in their learning of history, geography, arithmetic, etc. - as a language in ad hoc language lessons. Proceeding, a distinction is made between (a) unilingual-medium (or single-medium) schools and (b) bilingual-medium schools. In the single-medium school only one language is used as medium and in the public business of the school - assemblies, prayers, etc., - though in that school the second language will be taught in special lessons as a language, usually by the direct method. The single-medium school is found in localities where all the children are English-speaking, or where all the children are Afrikaans-speaking. It is also found in cities where the population is large enough to support separate schools for the two groups and where this separation is desired. The bilingual-medium school offers instruction in both media under one roof, either in parallel classes, where children of each group are instructed, each in their own language, in separate classrooms, though coming



together for general school activities, or in dual-medium classes, found typically in country areas where small numbers in the higher classes do not justify the appointment of double staffs, in which either one language is used as medium for some subjects and the other language for other subjects, or both languages may be used in each lesson, the one as major language and the other to give needed assistance to a small minority of the children. It is made clear that, in the tabulations of the results of the tests applied in the survey, both kinds of bilingual-medium school are grouped together.

150. Chapter III sets out the objects of the survey in the course of which standardised tests were applied to 12,634 children in the Transvaal, 3,933 in the Cape and 2,206 in Natal <sup>52</sup>. The children tested were in Standards IV to X (sixth to twelfth school years). The schools were selected in consultation with the provincial education authorities to provide for representative testing. The tests were analysed statistically according to age, Standard, intelligence quotient, economic environment, type of school organisation, etc., to assure that, when any particular point was being considered, other things were equal. A close correlation had been found in South Africa between the economic status of a community

---

52. The survey had to be closed shortly after the outbreak of the war before it could be extended to the Free State.





and its average intelligence.

151. The purpose of the survey was:

I. To determine the degree of bilingualism attained by children from the primary school to the completion of the secondary school and the relative rates of development in the mother-tongue and the other tongue under different environmental and school conditions.

II. To study the factors which determine linguistic growth in the child throughout his school career.

- (a) Individual or personal, e.g. the child's native intelligence. This was done by means of intelligence tests. Some of these tests were of a non-linguistic nature.
- (b) Factors connected with the child's home environment, e.g.
  - (i) The language used by father, mother, brothers, sisters, etc.
  - (ii) The cultural influences of the home, e.g. the books available, radio, etc.
  - (iii) The economic status of the home.
  - (iv) The attitude of the home towards the other language group and their cultural and spiritual goods, etc.
- (c) Extra-home influences, e.g. the church, cinema, sports, the child's friends and organisations like the Boy Scouts, Voortrekkers, etc.
- (d) School influences
  - (i) The efficacy of the language instruction, e.g. the qualifications of teachers and methods used;
  - (ii) The attitude of the staff and chiefly of the principal towards the second language and the language groups in the school;
  - (iii) The use of adjuvants, e.g. school library, assembly exercises, debating societies;



- (iv) The type of school organisation; viz. whether unilingual medium or bilingual (i.e. parallel or dual) medium.

III. The influence of medium on:-

- (a) the pupil's attainment in Afrikaans and English.
- (b) the pupil's progress in the other school subjects.
- (c) the pupil's general mental development (as reflected by intelligence tests).

IV. The degree to which lack of knowledge in one or both official languages affected the chances of employment and vocational advancement of young people after leaving school. This was, inter alia, done by a study of the records kept by Juvenile Affairs' Boards and by correspondence with large employers of juvenile labour.

152. Chapter IV looks more closely at the concept of 'home language'. The pupils filled in questionnaires saying which language they heard most at home, and whether a) father, b) mother, c) siblings, d) schoolmates spoke to them in English (always, often, sometimes, never) and in Afrikaans (always, often, sometimes, never). Other questions covered languages spoken by each of the testee's three best friends, language(s) listened to on the wireless, language of church and language of Sunday School. The linguistic environment of each pupil was worked out on a 12-point scale, when the following picture emerged:



Linguistic Structure of Home Environment  
of Pupils Tested.

				No. of Pupils	%	%
(a) Afrikaans unilingual	(0 Eng. 12 Afr.)	4,736	25	}	37	
(b) Afrikaans unilingual with slight English	{ 1 Eng. 11 Afr. 2 Eng. 10 Afr. }	2,165	12			
(c) Afrikaans bilingual	{ 3 Eng. 9 Afr. 4 Eng. 8 Afr. }	2,333	12	}	23	
(d) Bilingual (50-50)	{ 5 Eng. 7 Afr. 6 Eng. 6 Afr. 7 Eng. 5 Afr. }	828	5			
(e) English bilingual	{ 8 Eng. 4 Afr. 9 Eng. 3 Afr. }	1,165	6			
(f) English unilingual with slight Afri- kaans	{ 10 Eng. 2 Afr. 11 Eng. 1 Afr. }	1,502	8	}	40	
(g) English unilingual	(12 Eng. 0 Afr.)	6,044	32			
Total No. of Pupils Tested .. .. .				18,733	100	

153. From this tabulation it is seen that South African schoolchildren cannot be divided into two distinct groups of the English-speaking and the Afrikaans-speaking, but that a very considerable number of them hear both languages in varying degrees in their home environments. Figures based on the 1936 Union Census are quoted to show that in fact the great majority of the total population is bilingual.





## Bilingualism as to Provinces

## Percentage of Population speaking Official language

	Cape	Natal	Tvl.	O.F.S.	Total
(a) Both English and Afrikaans	66	44	66	69	64
(b) English only	15	53	18	3	19
(c) Afrikaans only	18	2	15	28	16

154. In chapter V it is pointed out that the all-or-none assumptions of the language ordinances, prescribing instruction either entirely through English, or entirely through Afrikaans, do not correspond with the much more complex language environment in which great numbers of South African children live.

155. Chapter VI considers the effect of instruction through the 'wrong' medium (i.e. the language which is not the home language) on the progress of the pupils. First, the effect on attainment in the two languages is examined, and second, the effect on attainment in two 'content' subjects, arithmetic and geography. For these purposes the achievement of Afrikaans-speaking children educated in English-medium classes (i.e., in the 'wrong' medium) was compared with the achievement of Afrikaans-medium children educated in Afrikaans-medium classes (i.e., in the home language). A similar comparison of English-speaking children was not possible as there were too



few of these in the 'wrong' medium to provide for statistically significant results.

156. Effect on attainment in English and Afrikaans 53.

If one adds together the scores obtained in English and Afrikaans, the combined score by this 'wrong medium' group is appreciably higher than that of Afrikaans unilingual pupils taught exclusively through Afrikaans medium on the one hand and of the English pupils taught exclusively through English medium on the other hand.

157. Below are given the combined 'standard' scores obtained in all the Afrikaans and English tests by pupils at the Standard VI stage, where a level of equal proficiency in both languages was reached by the 'wrong medium' group. By being taught exclusively (save in the Afrikaans-as-second-language classes) through the medium of English, pupils with unilingual Afrikaans home background lose about one-third of a year in Afrikaans. On the other hand, they gain about two years in their second language, English.

---

53. Ibid., p. 57.





Effect of Wrong Medium on Scores in English  
and Afrikaans

	Afr. Pupils in English Medium	Eng. Pupils in English Medium	Afr. Pupils in Afr. Medium	Eng. Pupils in Afr. Medium*
Afrikaans Score	468	341	488	(470)
English Score	468	506	352	(430)
TOTAL .. ..	936	847	840	(900)

(\*too few to be significant)

158. While this higher degree of bilingualism is not unexpected, the question arises: Has it not perhaps been attained at the expense of progress in the content subjects? To this question the study yielded the following answers:

1. Where the medium is the other language, children with a completely unilingual home background undoubtedly suffer an initial handicap in the learning process with regard to 'content' subjects (other than language), e.g. arithmetic, geography, history.

2. This handicap is more marked at the elementary stage than later.

3. The handicap is almost precisely in proportion to the relative strangeness of the language used as medium and is practically non-existent where the child's knowledge of the second language approximates that of his first language.

4. The handicap in a subject like arithmetic, where language plays a relatively small role, is less than in subjects like history and geography, where language plays a bigger role.

For example the tests showed that in the case of arithmetic at the Std. IV stage the children in the 'wrong' medium are, on an average, about three months behind those in mother-tongue medium, whereas



in geography they are nearly  $1\frac{1}{2}$  years behind.

5. The most interesting fact that the tests brought to light was that this handicap is not permanent. It diminishes as the pupil goes to higher standards. For example, the handicap in arithmetic vanishes entirely by the time the pupil gets to Std. VI.

An even more striking diminution of the initial handicap is observed in the case of geography. By the time the pupil gets to Std. V the handicap has diminished to one year, in Std. VI to four months. At Std. VII it has disappeared completely.

6. Following this comparison to the higher standards one finds the rather remarkable result that the Afrikaans home-language children who receive their geography instruction through English medium gradually outstrip those who receive their geography instruction through Afrikaans medium. In Std. VIII the 'wrong-medium' group are one quarter ahead, in Std. IX a little over two quarters and by Std. X four quarters ahead.

159. Two explanations are tentatively suggested for the unexpected result in senior geography. In the upper standards, the 'wrong-medium' group were slightly superior to the 'right-medium' group in intelligence tests but the difference was too slight to account for the whole difference in the geography results. The most likely explanation lay in the wider range of reading matter and illustrative material available in English.

160. The following general conclusion emerges:

Taking conditions as they are found in South Africa, where most children have experience with the second language, the school child placed in the 'wrong' medium suffers an initial, but not very serious handicap in his 'content' subjects, but as he progresses to higher standards the medium seems to become of decreasing significance and has



no observable adverse effect on his learning process. There are exceptions, but this is the total average result.

161. Chapter VII compares the achievement of pupils in unilingual (single-medium) schools with that of pupils in bilingual (parallel-medium and dual-medium) schools. Achievement in the two languages is summarised in the following table:





## Comparative Attainment in Language (English and Afrikaans)

Home Language and Medium of School	Average	'Standard'	Scores
	in Eng.	in Afr.	TOTAL
Bilinguals in bilingual school with:			
a) Predominantly English medium .. .. .	570	520	1090
b) Predominantly Afrikaans medium .. .. .	430	580	1010
	} 500	} 550	} 1050
Bilinguals in English-medium school ..	565	490	1055
Bilinguals in Afrikaans-medium school ..	465	570	1035
Unilingual Afrikaans children in English-medium school .. .. .	519	533	1052
Unilingual Afrikaans children in bilingual school .. .. .	432	570	1002
Unilingual Afrikaans children in Afrikaans-medium school ..	412	550	962
Unilingual English children in bilingual school	574	457	1031
Unilingual English children in English-medium school	577	365	972
Unilingual English children in Afrikaans-medium school .. .. .	(not enough data for this group)		

162. Achievement in two representative 'content' subjects was analysed. It appeared that in geography the pupils in



bilingual schools were about four-fifths of a year ahead of those in the unilingual schools and that in arithmetic they were half-a-year ahead. Reasons for the superiority of the achievement of this one type of school did not emerge clearly from the study, but the fact of the superiority was clearly established in respect of children of under-average intelligence as well as of the brighter children.

163. Chapter VIII compared social attitudes in bilingual and unilingual schools. It asks the question: Assuming that children come to school with sectional prejudices brought from their homes, does the school serve to break these prejudices down, or to intensify them?

164. Questions were asked designed to elicit, directly or indirectly, the attitudes of the pupils to English and Afrikaans as school subjects and to representative institutions (e.g. Boy Scouts, Voortrekkers). Among the questions were the following two:

- a) 'Do you think that English-speaking and Afrikaans-speaking children should go to the same or to different schools?'
- b) 'Do you think that English-speaking and Afrikaans-speaking children should play in the same or different teams in sport?'

165. The responses to all the questions were classified into four categories according to whether the degree of sectional discrimination shown was: a) none, b) slight, c) decided and d) excessive. The following table shows the percentage





of pupils showing 'strong sectional discrimination' in various types of school. ('Strong' discrimination includes the two categories c) 'decided' and d) 'excessive').

Type of School	% of Pupils Showing Strong Sectional Discrimination.	
Unilingual (City) Afrikaans medium ..	50	} 37
Unilingual (Town) Afrikaans medium ..	27	
Unilingual (City) English medium ..	16	} 17
Unilingual (Town) English medium ..	19	
Rural Afrikaans medium .... ..		38
Bilingual medium (parallel and dual)		
English dominant .. .. .		20
Bilingual medium (parallel and dual)		
Afrikaans dominant.. .. .		20

166. Reasons for these results are discussed but the main fact that stands out in the above figure is the relatively low index of sectional discrimination (20%) registered in the bilingual school in comparison with the unilingual school, particularly on the Afrikaans side (50%). This fact disposes in a definite way of the theory often advanced in categorical terms by advocates of the unilingual school, that if one mixes the two sections in one school one aggravates the antipathies which these children bring from their homes, and that it is far better to keep them in separate schools where each section will find itself and will in consequence respect and appreciate the other section better. Theories like these must be based on isolated but striking instances of antipathy which no doubt may have occurred in bilingual schools. We have here to do with the situation as a whole and to base our conclusions on the rule and not on the exceptions.<sup>54</sup>

---

54. Ibid., p. 83.



167. An interesting feature emerged in the analysis of the answers to the question: 'Do you think that English-speaking and Afrikaans-speaking children should go to the same or separate schools?' The results were as tabulated below:

Table showing percentages of pupils in each standard choosing SAME instead of separate schools for English- and Afrikaans-speaking children.

Type of School	IV	V	VI	VII	VIII	IX	X	Total
City Afrikaans unilingual medium .. ..	9	12	30	35	60	50	26	33
Rural Afrikaans medium	20	40	36	46	68	-	-	-
Town Afrikaans medium	27	27	32	70	77	83	69	49
Town English medium	21	32	33	75	79	89	95	49
City English unilingual medium.. .. .	16	32	46	54	67	76	78	48
Bilingual (i.e. parallel and dual) with Afrikaans medium dominant	54	73	84	74	82	85	88	75
Bilingual (i.e. parallel and dual) with English medium dominant	44	50	66	70	65	75	82	62
Total .. .. .	27	38	47	61	71	76	73	60% Total av.

It is pointed out that there is a general tendency for the proportion of pupils electing the same school to rise standard by standard as the pupils proceed up the school, with the



notable exception of the city Afrikaans-medium schools where the process stops at Standard VIII and goes into reverse.

168. In general, the results led to the following conclusions:

- a) Adverse sectional discrimination is from three to four times as great in unilingual as in bilingual schools.
- b) Of the unilingual schools it is greater in the Afrikaans medium than in the English medium schools.
- c) Of the bilingual schools it is slightly greater in those where English is predominant than in those where Afrikaans is predominant.
- d) The children with bilingual home environment display the least adverse discrimination.

169. Chapter IX describes the results of tests given to assess the social attitudes of students of the four Teachers' Colleges of the Transvaal, three of which, Pretoria, Potchefstroom and Heidelberg, use the Afrikaans medium while the fourth, Johannesburg, uses the English.

170. In reply to a question on the desirability of the same schools, or separate schools, for English-speaking and Afrikaans-speaking children, students at the Afrikaans-medium Colleges voted 67 per cent for the same schools and 33 per cent for the separate, while students at the English-medium College voted 87 per cent for the same schools and 13 per cent for the separate.

171. Students were asked to signify varying degrees of agreement and disagreement with two statements. The percentage





agreeing strongly, or agreeing, at the four Colleges is shown in the following table:

Percentage of students signifying degrees of agreement and disagreement with certain statements

Statement	Institution	(A) Agree Strongly	(B) Agree
Every white South African who has the real interests of his country at heart should strive to bring about as complete an identity or fusion of interests as possible between the two dominant white 'races'.	Potchefstroom	26	27
	Heidelberg	22	36
	Pretoria	30	41
	Johannesburg	67	20
School teachers who hold very extreme views should be given complete freedom and even encouraged to engage in propaganda both inside as well as outside the school.	Potchefstroom	13	8
	Heidelberg	6	10
	Pretoria	1	3
	Johannesburg	4	-

'The most significant point in the above table is the clear indication that the larger the percentage of students who favour racial co-operation, the smaller the percentage who would use the schools for purposes of propaganda.' 55

172. Chapter X discusses the role of the school in relation to language and citizenship in South Africa. Chapter XI summarises the main conclusions. Neither chapter lends itself

---

55. Ibid., p. 95.



to substantial reduction.

173. In concluding this section, it seems desirable to make two points placing this very valuable 1938 survey in historical perspective:

i) The survey was made at a time when the great majority of White South Africans were supporters of the 'Fusion' Government of Generals Hertzog and Smuts, though there was a substantial Afrikaner sectionalist ('Nationalist') movement and a smaller English sectionalist movement (politically represented by the small Dominion Party). Within a year, the war was to cause a more deeply felt political division than South Africa had known since Union. Before the end of the war, several of the tests applied in the survey might have yielded more discouraging answers.

ii) In comparing the results of this survey with the results of investigations into later experiments with double-medium education one fundamental difference should be borne in mind. The survey looked at bilingual schools and dual-medium education where they were naturally found because the parents, for their own good reasons, wanted them. One could therefore assume cordial co-operation between parents, teachers and children in making the most of a system which they had adopted as best fitted to meet the needs of their children. Later experiments in dual-medium education involved the





partial adoption of dual-medium in schools which, for their own reasons, had organised their programmes differently. These experiments were bound to encounter various degrees of emotional resistance in teachers, parents and children, with appreciable effects on the results.



## VII

Experiments in Bilingual Education

174. The following tables<sup>56</sup> show the use of English and Afrikaans as media of instruction in provincial schools for the years 1932, 1939 and 1946, thus carrying a stage further the figures given in paragraph 133 above.

Medium of Instruction in Provincial Schools (Percentages)

	Primary			Secondary			Total		
	E.	A.	E&A	E.	A.	E&A	E.	A.	E&A
<u>Cape</u>									
1932	33.2	52.1	14.7	51.3	28.4	20.3	35.5	49.0	15.5
1939	31.2	60.7	8.1	36.9	46.3	16.8	32.2	58.2	9.6
1946	30.2	65.5	4.3	33.6	61.2	5.2	30.9	64.7	4.4
<u>Natal</u>									
1932	87.8	9.3	2.9	93.9	5.6	0.5	88.6	8.8	2.6
1939	84.7	14.8	0.5	88.2	9.5	2.3	85.2	14.0	0.8
1946	78.3	18.7	3.0	81.3	16.1	2.6	78.8	18.2	3.0
<u>Transvaal</u>									
1932	35.5	59.9	4.6	57.5	32.0	10.5	37.2	57.7	8.1
1939	33.3	65.3	1.4	40.2	58.2	1.6	34.2	64.4	1.4
1946	29.6	68.5	1.9	35.5	62.0	2.5	30.5	67.5	2.5
<u>O.F.S.</u>									
1932	13.0	85.4	1.6	16.9	34.8	48.3	13.6	34.8	48.3
1939	10.7	89.2	0.1	15.4	76.4	8.2	11.6	76.4	8.2
1946	8.3	89.9	1.8	12.8	84.2	3.0	9.2	84.2	3.0
<u>Union</u>									
1932	35.6	56.1	8.3	51.2	28.2	20.6	37.4	52.9	9.7
1939	33.9	62.2	3.9	38.2	51.5	9.3	34.8	60.5	4.7
1946	31.9	65.2	2.9	35.7	60.6	3.7	32.5	64.4	3.1

56. Bulletin of Educational Statistics for the Union of South Africa, 1947. Government Printer, Pretoria.



175. It will be observed that the tendencies apparent from 1932 to 1939 continued to 1946. The proportion of children enrolled in English-medium classes continued to decline particularly in the secondary classes. The proportion being instructed through both media also continued to decline, and particularly in the secondary classes. The proportion being educated in the Afrikaans medium rose accordingly. The main reasons would seem to have been a) the upswelling of Afrikaans sentiment caused by the symbolic Centenary Trek celebrations in 1938, b) the increasing confidence of Afrikaans-speaking communities in Afrikaans-medium instruction, based on the steadily improving availability of text-books for secondary schools and of general literature in Afrikaans, and c) the higher birthrate of the Afrikaans-speaking. It should also be mentioned that the Union figure for education through both media in 1946 - 3.1 per cent - was higher than the figure for 1945 - 2.1 per cent - against the general trend, largely because of new legislation which will be discussed later in this section.

176. These years are also notable for a feature which does not appear from the percentages. Because of increasing industrialisation, there was, as part of the general movement of population from the country areas to the cities, an incidental movement from the Cape and Free State to the Transvaal and Natal. For the first time, White school enrolments in the Transvaal rose in 1939 to the level of Cape enrolments. The Transvaal was to go on increasing - at present its schools





contain about half of the total school population. Natal's school enrolments between 1932 and 1946 increased by about 28 per cent. Natal enrolments were in due course to exceed those of the Free State. The new urban populations were, of course, increasingly Afrikaans-speaking. The actual figures (provincial schools only) are set out below, the figures for 1963 being added to indicate later development.

	<u>1932</u>	<u>1939</u>	<u>1946</u>	<u>1963</u>
Cape	149,311	156,579	156,404	200,049
Natal	27,012	29,525	34,592	66,268
Transvaal	133,358	156,481	181,434	333,559
O.F.S.	45,384	43,046	41,454	64,099

177. The outbreak of war in 1939 brought with it a split in the United Party Government. General Hertzog and many of his followers in Parliament were opposed to the Union's entering into the war at that time. General Smuts and the majority were for joining Britain forthwith. General Smuts formed a new government to prosecute the war.

178. General Hertzog and Dr. Malan, the leader of the 'purified' Nationalists, now found themselves on the same side again. There was early agreement on the principle of the formation of one reunited Nationalist party; the details were left to be worked out later. Before this could be done, Hitler overran Western Europe, and the 'purified', believing that Hitler had won the war, thought the time ripe for obtaining a Boer republic on



their own terms. At a republican rally in Bloemfontein which drew a crowd of 50,000, resolutions were passed in favour of a free, independent South African republic 'founded on the religion, history and traditions of the Boer people and on the principles of Christian-Nationalism.'<sup>57</sup> This led to disagreement between Hertzog and Malan which came to a head when the Free State Congress of their reunited party met to consider a detailed programme of principles. Hertzog and Swart (Free State leader of the Malan party) both submitted drafts. Hertzog's draft contained a guarantee of equal rights for the English. Swart's gave no such undertaking. When Swart's draft was accepted as basis of discussion, Hertzog waited until the clause-by-clause discussion began. He then asked for a clause guaranteeing the rights of the English. Receiving no reply, he resigned from the Party and withdrew into private life. The next year, while Hitler was still apparently irresistible, a draft Nationalist constitution for a republic was sent by the Party to a semi-military nationalist organisation, the Ossewa-Brandwag, and published by it, to the annoyance of the Party, in July 1941. The draft relegated English to inferior status. Later, the Party explained that the draft had never got beyond draft stage, or been officially adopted. It had, nevertheless, revealed very clearly the direction in which top-level Nationalist thought was running and the direction in which, given such circumstances as an Allied collapse and a Nationalist assumption of power in South Africa, action might be anticipated.

---

57. Cope, op.cit., pp.115-117.





179. General Smuts's United Party was in the majority not only in Parliament but also in all of the Provincial Councils except the Free State throughout the war years. The Party was deeply concerned at the increasingly serious nature of the political division in South Africa, more especially as this seemed to indicate an increasing tendency to division along English-Afrikaner lines. Apart from its implications for the general national well-being, such a division would, of course, also be fatal to a Party whose basic principle was English-Afrikaner co-operation.

180. Parliament, on 24th May, 1944, passed the following resolution:

'That this House taking account of the fact that the South Africa Act enshrines as its fundamental principle the conception of a united country and South African people, and to that end provided for a Legislative Union of South Africa and for equal rights of both official languages, considers it necessary that everything should be done to foster national unity and to provide equal opportunities for all citizens to learn both official languages.

'It therefore, with a view to serving these objects, expresses the advisability that the Government in consultation with the Provincial Authorities, considers the amendment where necessary of the educational laws and regulations and the revision of the educational machinery of the provinces so as to give effect within a period of five years to the following principles:

- (1) that the child should be instructed through its home language in the early stages of its educational career;



- (2) that the second language should be introduced gradually as a supplementary medium of instruction from the stage at which it is on educational grounds appropriate to do so; and
- (3) that such changes should be introduced in the system of the training of teachers as are necessary to make the ideals of bilingualism and of national unity in the schools fully effective.'

181. In the following paragraphs, details will be given of minor and major experiments in the use of the second language as medium which were carried out from 1943 onwards in Natal, the Cape, and Transvaal.

(a) Natal

In 1942 the Natal Provincial Council passed an Education Ordinance (Ordinance No. 23, 1942) consolidating previous legislation on education, and in this Ordinance made new provision, inter alia for the teaching of the official languages.

Section 12 of this Ordinance provided:

'12. (1) In every Government European and Coloured School every pupil above sub-standard two shall be taught both official languages: provided that in Government European schools the time to be devoted to that language which has not been selected as the medium of instruction, shall be not less than two and a half hours or more than four hours per week.





(2) In addition every pupil above standard one in Government European schools shall be taught some other portion of the curriculum for not less than one-half hour or more than one hour per day, through the medium of that language which has not been selected as the medium of instruction; provided that the provisions of this sub-section shall apply only to standard two in the year 1943 but thereafter to an additional standard in numerical order, each year, until it has become applicable to the highest standard of the secondary school.'

182. In 1949, the present writer, then Chief Inspector of Schools in Natal, made a survey of the time allocated in practice by schools to instruction a) in, and b) through the medium of, the second language, and an assessment of the measure of success which had attended the application of Section 12(2) of the Ordinance. The following paragraphs are based on his report<sup>58</sup>.

Instruction in the second language as a language. It was found that the arrangements at practically every school visited complied with section 12(1) of the Ordinance. In a very small number of schools an occasional class was found receiving language instruction for a few minutes below the minimum or above the maximum time laid down, but only in one school was the time allocation substantially below the requirement. This was a small school organised on a dual-medium basis and the decreased time for second language instruction was compensated for by the very ample opportunities

---

58. Full copy appended for information.





to use the language in the general business of the school. Usually the time allocated to the teaching of the second language in terms of section 12 (1) was found to be from 150 to 200 minutes in Standards I to IV, and very close to 240 minutes in Standards V to VI.

183. Teaching through the medium of the second language.

Section 12 (2) of the Ordinance had not been applied as fully as section 12 (1). Briefly, the position was as follows:

i) Of the 28 secondary schools in the provincial system, 5 schools serving bilingual local communities were organised on dual-medium lines, English and Afrikaans-speaking pupils being instructed together as one group, now in one language, now in the other. This organisation preceded the Ordinance. It had been introduced partly because of the small size of the secondary classes in certain subjects in these schools.

With only two teachers available, the allocation

Standards VII A. + E. .. .. 1st teacher

Standards VIII A. + E. .. .. 2nd teacher

was preferred by teachers to

Standards VII + VIII E. .. .. 1st teacher

Standards VII + VIII A. .. .. 2nd teacher.

It should be remembered that the schools served generally bilingual communities, and that the Education Department selected fluently bilingual teachers for these schools.



- ii) Of the other 23 secondary schools one gave 2 hours 45 minutes to work through the second-language medium, one gave 2 hours 40 minutes, seven gave the prescribed minimum of 2 hours 30 minutes and thirteen gave less than the minimum prescribed time (six of these less than half the minimum time).
- iii) In primary schools, most time-tables made the minimum provision for second-medium lessons, but in practice less time was often given.

184. The main reason why more time had not been made available was the lack of thoroughly bilingual teachers. Probably if the experiment had been limited to senior classes where bilingual teachers were available better results would have been obtained. In most parts of the Province it took teachers of Standards II and III (fourth and fifth school years) about twice as long to convey a given amount of subject matter through the second language. Second-medium lessons at this level tended to become language lessons pure and simple. After Standard V, more ground could be covered. But most teachers tended to avoid subjects with a technical vocabulary, or which required close reasoning. 'General Knowledge' became a favourite subject. In other words, most teachers would not trust themselves to cover the year's work in subjects like arithmetic or geography through the second medium.





185. In the secondary schools the dual-medium classes continued to function admirably. But only exceptionally did teachers in single-medium schools derive satisfaction from their results in second-medium work. One reason was that the linguistic qualifications of many teachers were inadequate. Another was the impatience of many pupils (particularly in classes being prepared for public examinations) with anything that seemed to come between them and smooth progress through their prescribed syllabuses. A little extra Afrikaans - or English - was in order....until you felt it getting between you and the point in geography or mathematics that the teacher was trying to make.

There was a general consensus among teachers (borne out by standardised tests) that the standard of the two languages - as second languages - in Natal schools had improved considerably since before the war. There was wide disagreement as to the part played by the second-medium lessons in bringing about this improvement. Other factors were:

a) a better general appreciation of the need for bilingualism,  
 b) more parental encouragement - the English-medium pupils were, increasingly, the children of parents who themselves had learnt Afrikaans at school, c) better qualified language teachers. Improvement in the second language due to the second-medium lessons had not, it was generally felt, been commensurate with the time spent.



186. Attempts were then made to find more objective evidence. 'Certain results of the Standard VI examination of 1948 were subjected to a special scrutiny. Inspectors gave me the names of eight schools (referred to below as Group A) in which, in their opinion, the second-medium lessons had been given unusually well, and of eight other schools (referred to below as Group B) in which they had been given poorly, if at all. I compared the performance of the two groups in Afrikaans as Second Language, and by way of control, in Arithmetic.

The results were as follows:

						Average Mark	
						Group A	Group B
Afrikaans as second language	..	..				108	107
Arithmetic	..	..	..	..	..	93	91

Against this negative evidence from the Standard VI Examination may be set the generally positive tendency of the results of standardised vocabulary tests to be described below.'

187. Pupils in Standards VII and VIII in Natal secondary schools in 1949 had had second-medium lessons since 1944 and 1943 respectively. Pupils in Standards IX and X had had no such lessons - the Ordinance had only applied to the Standard II of 1942 and subsequent years. It was therefore decided to apply standardised tests to all pupils in Standards VII, VIII and IX. The only tests available were an English Vocabulary Test (U.E.56) and an Afrikaans Vocabulary Test (U.E.170) for which norms for the whole Union had been



established before the war. Separate provincial norms had unfortunately not been established.

The results are given below in summary form.

a) English Medium Pupils

	Std. VII	Std. VIII	Std. IX
i) Afrikaans Test -			
(X) Union norm (pre-war)	9.7	13.9	17.2
(Y) Natal average, 1949	11.7	15.2	16.9
(Y) As percentage of (X)	120.4	109.4	98.3
ii) English Test -			
(X) Union norm (pre-war)	21.1	24.9	28.6
(Y) Natal average, 1949	22.2	25.6	27.9
(Y) As percentage of (X)	105.2	102.8	97.6

b) Afrikaans Medium Pupils

i) English Test -			
(X) Union norm (pre-war)	9.4	12.2	18.5
(Y) Natal average, 1949	12.9	15.6	20.3
(Y) As percentage of (X)	137.2	127.8	109.7
ii) Afrikaans Test -			
(X) Union norm (pre-war)	24.1	31.0	35.8
(Y) Natal average, 1949	28.2	32.0	38.2
(Y) As percentage of (X)	117.0	103.2	106.7.

188. While there were many complicating factors at work, the improvements shown in both languages as second languages in Standards VII and VIII may have been due, in part at least, to the second-medium instruction these pupils had had over several years.





189. Further analysis of the results threw an interesting light on factors outside the school which strongly influenced the learning of a second language.

190. First, results in single-medium and parallel-medium schools were compared. I quote:

'a) English-medium Pupils

	Std. VII	Std. VIII	Std. IX
i) Afrikaans Test -			
Single-medium Schools	10.7	13.9	15.6
Parallel-medium Schools	17.6	22.2	24.8
ii) English Test -			
Single-medium Schools	22.0	25.5	27.8
Parallel-medium Schools	23.5	26.3	28.2

'The English-medium pupils in the parallel-medium schools were not inferior in English vocabulary to their contemporaries in the single-medium schools. Their average score is slightly superior in all three standards but the differences are not statistically significant. In Afrikaans vocabulary, however, the scores of the English-medium pupils in parallel-medium schools were consistently better, to a highly significant degree. Before giving all the credit for this superiority to the parallel organisation of the schools it was thought necessary, however, to examine the scores of the Afrikaans-medium pupils.



## b) Afrikaans-medium Pupils

	Std. VII	Std. VIII	Std. IX
i) English Test -			
Single-medium Schools	13.9	16.4	21.8
Parallel-medium Schools	12.4	15.4	19.4
ii) Afrikaans Test -			
Single-medium Schools	26.7	30.7	36.1
Parallel-medium Schools	29.0	32.9	39.6

'While the differences here were comparatively small, their consistent tendencies were of great interest. The English of Afrikaans-medium pupils in single-medium schools would appear to be rather better than that of Afrikaans-medium pupils in parallel-medium schools, and their Afrikaans worse! The explanation of this apparent paradox seems to lie outside the school.

'The English-medium pupils of our parallel-medium secondary and high schools live in comparatively small, bilingual country towns where Afrikaans is freely used. This social situation, reinforced by the parallel organisation of their schools, the bilingual assemblies, etc. gives them a great advantage in Afrikaans over their contemporaries in the English single-medium schools which are situated in predominantly English-speaking parts of the province.





'The geographical distribution of the Afrikaans-medium pupils leads to different results. The single-medium pupils, minority groups in the predominantly English-speaking Pietermaritzburg and Durban, learn so much English incidentally from their environment that, in spite of the purely Afrikaans organisation of their schools, they score better marks in English than their parallel-medium contemporaries: and the Afrikaans organisation of their schools fails to give them Afrikaans vocabularies equal to those of their contemporaries in communities where Afrikaans is in general use, even though the latter are in parallel-medium schools'

191. Second, the results were analysed on a regional basis.

I quote further:

(i) English-medium Secondary Pupils

'In respect of achievement in Afrikaans, pupils of our single-medium schools can be subdivided into two groups: Group A, being those along the Coast, including Durban, and Group B, being those in the Midlands, including Pietermaritzburg; and pupils of our parallel-medium schools can also be divided into two broad groups, Group C being those in Dundee and south and east of Dundee, where the majority of the pupils in each school is English-speaking, and Group D being those schools to the north and to the west of Dundee, where the majority of the pupils in each school is Afrikaans-speaking.



Average scores for each group in Afrikaans were as follows:-

					Std. VII	Std. VIII	Std. IX
Group A	..	..	..	..	9.5	12.7	13.7
Group B	..	..	..	..	13.7	16.7	18.2
Group C	..	..	..	..	15.8	20.2	20.0
Group D	..	..	..	..	19.7	24.6	29.4
(Union norm)	..	..	..	..	(9.7)	(13.9)	(17.2)

'The weakness of Group A is undoubtedly related to the predominantly English-speaking character of the coastal community. Afrikaans is comparatively little heard in the typical commercial and industrial activities of Durban. English-medium pupils at the Coast find Afrikaans less in practical use than their contemporaries do elsewhere in Natal; and they develop less facility in Afrikaans at school.

'Pietermaritzburg is an administrative and educational centre and its people, and those of the Midlands generally, have therefore a more general appreciation of the practical usefulness of Afrikaans than people at the Coast have. There is also a larger proportion of Afrikaans-speaking people in the population (Afrikaans-medium pupils are 21.1 per cent of the Government School population in Pietermaritzburg as compared with 10.7 per cent in Durban). The influence of these facts is reflected in the scores of the Group B pupils, which are above the Union norm in all standards, and very significantly so in Standards VII and VIII.



'In the school populations of schools like Dundee and Greytown, English-speaking and Afrikaans-speaking are more equally balanced, though the majority is English-speaking. The school organisation is parallel, and both languages are freely used in the daily business of the schools. Group C scores would appear to reflect this social situation.

'The highest English-medium scores in Afrikaans are those of the Group D schools, those parallel-medium schools to the north and to the west of Dundee where the Afrikaans-medium pupils form the majority group and where the English-speaking pupils find the stimulus of the Afrikaans of the community at its highest.'

(ii) Afrikaans-medium Secondary Pupils

Average scores in English

	Std. VII	Std. VIII	Std. IX
School parallel but majority Afrikaans-speaking .. ..	12.0	14.2	18.6
Afrikaans single-medium schools (2) .. .. .	13.9	16.4	21.8
School parallel but majority English-speaking .. ..	14.6	17.8	23.8

192. Summarising:

(a) The dual-medium organisation worked smoothly where there was already a fairly bilingual group of pupils, where the teachers were thoroughly bilingual, where the community was bilingual (or felt unilinguality to be a handicap) and where the system was organisationally convenient.





(b) The use of the second language as a medium was very unprofitable up to Standard IV. Above that Standard it led to improved knowledge of the second language, but not, save where all circumstances were favourable, to an extent commensurate with the expenditure of time. In varying degrees, depending on circumstances, it slowed down the learning of the 'content' subjects. There was no statistical evidence of harm to the development of the home language.

(c) The degree of bilingualism attained by pupils in Natal secondary schools was seen to depend very largely on the extent to which the second language was heard outside the language lessons - in the assemblies and activities of a parallel-medium school, or in the general community outside the school.

#### (b) The Cape Province

193. The Cape Province officially re-introduced dual-medium instruction on a strictly experimental basis<sup>59</sup>. Any surviving natural habitats of the system were left in peace - and out of the experiment. Single-medium and parallel-medium schools were so selected as to give representative cover, and school committees and principals were persuaded to take part.

---

59. Report on the Experiment Involving the Use of the Second Official Language as a Medium of Instruction. Department of Public Education, Cape of Good Hope. Cape Town, 1951.



The Province was divided into two regions for the purposes of the experiment, Region No. 1, the Cape Peninsula, and Region No. 2, the rest of the Province. Professor H.A. Reyburn of the University of Cape Town was chairman of one regional committee, and Professor J.A.J. van Rensburg of the University of Stellenbosch of the other. In all, 10,662 pupils in Standards IV, V and VI were involved in the experiment, 6,053 in experimental classes and 4,609 in control classes. The amount of time given to instruction (in Arithmetic, History, Geography, etc.) through the medium of the second language rose from about  $1\frac{1}{2}$  hours a week in Standard IV to 6-7 hours a week in Standard VI. The ordinary lessons in the second language as a language continued as usual. The school week contained 25 hours.

194. Region No. 1 conducted the experiment during the years 1945-9 and Region No. 2 during the years 1946-9. In his Report<sup>60</sup> on Region No. 1, Professor Reyburn wrote:

1. The experiment shows no appreciable effect of the dual medium instruction on the home language. In only two cases out of twenty-seven is there any significant difference between the dual and the single medium groups. Two schools are concerned in each instance and the two results are opposed in direction, being one in favour of the single, and one in favour of the dual medium.

---

60. Loc. cit., p.27.





2. There is definite evidence that under the conditions of the experiment an advantage tends to accrue to the dual medium class in respect of the second language. Out of fifty-one results ten may be regarded as significant. Two are in favour of the single medium class, one school being affected in each instance, and neither is of high significance. Eight are in favour of the dual medium class, four being of high significance, two of moderate and one of low. In these cases the number of schools range from three to nine. The balance is clearly in favour of the dual medium classes, written and oral tests being about equally affected.

3. There is no definite advantage to either group in reference to the content subjects. Of seventy-six results, twenty-five are significant, thirteen being in favour of the single medium and twelve in favour of the dual. Systematic local factors which affect different schools in different classes in different ways, are of more importance in these subjects than the use of the single or dual medium.

To sum up. The effect of the dual medium, for good or for ill, can easily be over-estimated. In well-organized schools, in or near the city, with the hearty co-operation of an instructed and competent staff, it appears to promote the command of the second language to a limited extent, and its effect, both on the command of the home language and on the knowledge of the content subject, is negligible.'

195. Professor van Rensburg summarises his conclusions on the results obtained in Region No. 2 as follows:

'Under existing circumstances the use of the second language as the medium of instruction in one subject in Standard IV, two subjects in Standard V and three subjects in Standard VI has the following results:

In schools where the knowledge of the second language was very weak, the second language profited but the content subjects suffered; and in schools where the knowledge of the second language was better, the second language did not profit nor did the content subjects suffer.



The results either in favour of the second language or disadvantageous to the content subjects, are, although statistically significant, very small.'

196. Professor van Rensburg also reports:

'The views of the teachers concerned, and of principals of schools were invited on the question of the practical application of dual-medium in their schools. From their evidence it would appear that they can be classified into three groups: (1) those who feel that the experiment sets them a task which is a challenge to their professional ability and who apply themselves with enthusiasm; (2) those for whom the experiment is a burden and who wish to see the end of it; and lastly (3) those who are opposed to it in principle and perform their duties with distaste.'

197. Continuing, Professor van Rensburg refers to one large centre (East London) where all three types were found and where the reactions of the pupils reflected the spirit in which the experiment had been carried out. At school A a boy who had been in the experimental class in the junior school was inadvertently placed in the control class on his promotion to the senior school. This he regarded as an injustice, and he went to the principal to ask for a transfer to the experimental class. At school B the mood was 'one of suffering under a temporary nuisance and longing for the day of deliverance.' At school C 'feeling against the experiment reached such a pitch among the pupils that they formed an "Ink Spot Club", and the position of the responsible teacher became untenable.'





## (c) Transvaal

198. Both Natal and Cape applications of the dual-medium principle had been limited. The Natal provision had involved all pupils from Standard II upwards, but the second-medium lessons took up only a very limited part of the school day. The Cape experiment had applied only to selected schools and the second-medium lessons had taken up only 6-7 hours per week at the maximum. The Transvaal Ordinance<sup>61</sup> was a much more uncompromising measure.

199. Section 3 of the Ordinance requires that every pupil in every standard shall be taught...the other language as a subject, and that all necessary steps (including the use of it as a supplementary medium of instruction) shall be taken to ensure that the standard of proficiency attained therein by the end of the fifth Standard is such that it will be possible for the pupil thereafter to have such language as a medium of instruction. Section 4 provided, inter alia, that 'the course of instruction in the two languages shall from the beginning of 1946 be framed in such a way as to secure as far as possible one equal standard of proficiency in both languages....'

---

61. The Education Amendment Ordinance of 1945.





200. Section 6 of the Ordinance deals with medium of instruction in public and private schools in Standards above the Fifth Standard. It reads:

'6. (1) In respect of all the standards of any public or private school above the fifth standard both languages shall be used as media of instruction and the following provisions shall apply -

(a) that as from the coming into operation of this Ordinance the other language shall be taught in all standards exclusively through the medium of that language;

(b) as from the commencement of the year 1946 one additional subject shall be taught through the medium of the other language to every pupil in Standard VI and as from the commencement of the year 1947 an additional subject shall be taught through the medium of the other language to every pupil in Standard VII and so on to every pupil in each consecutive year thereafter;

(c) that as from the beginning of the year 1951 both languages shall be used on as nearly as possible an equal basis as media of instruction in every public and private school.

'(2) The selection of subjects which in terms of sub-section (1) shall be taught through the medium of the other language shall be made by the Director.'

201. The Transvaal Ordinance, like the Natal one, also provided that teachers joining the service after the appointed date would be paid the normal annual salary increments only if they were qualified to teach in both languages as prescribed.



202. The far-reaching Transvaal Ordinance was the subject of strong controversy from beginning to end. The United Party was convinced that it was a measure which would promote bilingualism, mutual understanding, and a broadly based and comprehensive South African citizenship. English-speaking teachers, though concerned at its drastic nature, were generally, like English parents, prepared to give it a trial. Some middle-of-the-road Afrikaans teachers were strongly in favour of it. But the Afrikaans teachers' association, the T.O. (Transvaalse Onderwysers vereniging) opposed it strongly and consistently as an interference with the 'sound principle of mother-tongue education'. The F.A.K. and the I.C.N.O. also opposed it strongly. In the Transvaal Provincial Council the National Party minority fought it in debates dragged out over many weeks and in the end protested by walk-out.

203. The Ordinance became effective from the beginning of the school year in January 1946, and clouds soon began to gather. In April, the Director of Education, opening the Congress of the T.O., said that as the Ordinance had been approved by the provincial legislature, it was the duty of teachers, parents and children to carry out its provisions. But the Congress reaffirmed its faith in mother-tongue education and the single-medium school. On 2nd August Die Transvaler reported interviews with head of Afrikaans-medium schools who had said that after six months' experience,





the impracticability of the provision was becoming much clearer that it had been. On 6th and 7th August the Star reported unfavourable reactions from heads of English-medium schools, some of whom were viewing the system 'with increasing apprehension'. Despite reassuring statements from the Education Department, concern continued to grow, particularly after the extended application of second-language instruction in 1947 gave a clearer picture of things to come. A considerable number of parents who could afford the expense began sending their children to schools outside the Transvaal. The S.O.E. (Sons of England Society) objected that the Ordinance was discouraging immigrants and, in general, sacrificing education to bilingualism. Heads of private schools said it wasted time and retarded progress. While most objectors stressed the practical difficulties, other reasons were strongly in evidence<sup>62</sup>. There were those who saw in the Ordinance a British imperialist plot. There were also those who saw in it a threat to the future of the English language: with four out of five teachers Afrikaans-speaking, Afrikaans would be taught with spirit to all children, whereas English would survive as 'a mere ritual of instruction'. Against the stream, the Bilingual Schools Association continued to champion the principles and the ideals of citizenship underlying the Ordinance. It was a heavy blow when the Transvaal Teachers' Association, which in the beginning had been well-disposed, joined the ranks of the doubters. If the teachers, if the principals, if the parents, if the children all were

62. See unpublished thesis by R. Potgieter, Dubbelmedium-onderwys in die Transvaalse Middelbare Skoolwese gedurende die Vierjarige Toepassing van die Onderwyswet (Taal-wysigingsordonnansie van 1945. Pretoria, 1950.



co-operative, said the T.T.A. president, the obligations laid on them by the Ordinance could be carried out, but in the absence of these conditions the Ordinance could not fulfil its purpose. By March, 1948, public uneasiness had become so great that the Executive Committee of the Province set up a special departmental committee consisting of representatives of the Education Department and of the different types of school to study the reports of inspectors of schools on the working of the system in practice.

204. The committee's report was critical. The Ordinance had gone too far and too fast. Practical difficulties had made it impossible to apply acceptably. Its drastic requirements and compulsory character had caused unfavourable emotional attitudes among teachers, parents and pupils. It was not fostering bilingualism as planned. In August a Draft Ordinance was published which would have reduced the amount of time devoted to instruction through the medium of the second language to one hour per week and would have removed other features of the 1945 Ordinance which had proved objectionable. The Draft, with minor amendments (the time to be devoted to second-medium teaching was raised to  $1\frac{1}{2}$  hours a week) was passed, though it was opposed by the Nationalist opposition which took its stand on the undiluted mother-tongue-medium principle.





205. Before the new Ordinance could be approved by the Governor-General, the General Election of 1948 had resulted in the defeat of General Smuts and in the assumption of the reins of government by the National Party, with Dr. D.F. Malan as Prime Minister. The Governor-General-in-Council was not prepared to approve the new Transvaal Ordinance which, after a year, lapsed. In the meantime, the dual-medium requirements were greatly relaxed: it was no longer necessary to teach an examination subject through the second medium.

206. In the Provincial Council elections of 1949, the National Party gained the majority in the Transvaal Council. After a debate which went on during most of October and November, 1949, an amending Ordinance was passed which not only reintroduced compulsory mother-tongue medium but extended it, eliminating parental choice until after Standard VIII.

207. In 1950, the Natal Provincial Council rescinded the dual-medium requirements of its 1942 Ordinance. The Cape experiments came to an end. The plans for encouraging bilingualism and good relations through general dual-medium education were dropped, though in some small schools, where local circumstances are favourable, the dual-medium organisation continues to be chosen and to function to the satisfaction of parents, teachers and pupils<sup>63</sup>.

---

63. Statistically, one might also include in the dual-medium category not only these schools in which the dual-medium organization is voluntarily adopted by two groups each entitled to parallel facilities, but also to the very many country schools in which the minority group is too small to be able to claim parallel facilities and in which minority-group pupils are helped, in varying measure, in their home language by teachers using the majority language for most of their classroom business. Such classes are, however, classed as 'Parallel (b)' in Table C at the end of Section IX.









